Livelihoods Analysis of Landmine/ERW Affected Communities in Herat Province Afghanistan (October 2011)

Barry Pound, Åsa Massleberg, Qudous Ziaee, Samim Hashimi, Shapur Qayyumi and Ted Paterson

Report: July 2012
The Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining (GICHD), an international expert organisation legally based in Switzerland as a non-profit foundation, works for the elimination of mines, explosive remnants of war and other explosive hazards, such as unsafe munitions stockpiles. The GICHD provides advice and capacity development support, undertakes applied research, disseminates knowledge and best practices and develops standards. In cooperation with its partners, the GICHD's work enables national and local authorities in affected countries to effectively and efficiently plan, coordinate, implement, monitor and evaluate safe mine action programmes, as well as to implement the Anti-Personnel Mine Ban Convention, the Convention on Cluster Munitions and other relevant instruments of international law. The GICHD follows the humanitarian principles of humanity, impartiality, neutrality and independence.

This report was written by Barry Pound, Åsa Massleberg, Qudous Ziaee, Samim Hashimi, M. Shapur Qayyumi and Ted Paterson.

© Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining
The designation employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the GICHD concerning the legal status of any country, territory or armed groups, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project was a team effort involving a number of organisations (GICHD, GMAP, MACCA, DMC, CSO, AIRD, DDG, ARCS, HALO Trust, OMAR and MCPA) each of which made useful contributions to the outcome. In particular, we would like to thank all of those who made our stay in Herat productive and relaxing – especially those who arranged logistics and ensured our safety. The AMAC manager (Muaqeem Noori), Walid (AMAC security officer) and the drivers looked after us extremely well. We were very lucky to enjoy the hospitality of Najiba and Abdul Qader in Herat, and would like to thank them for that memorable experience.

We are also very grateful to the four communities for the friendly and hospitable way that they received us. We hope that the information in this report will benefit these and other mine-affected communities in Afghanistan.

Participants in the Herat Landmines and Livelihoods survey
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACRONYMS</strong></td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</strong></td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main conclusions and recommendations arising from the survey</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (PRIORITISATION)</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (PRIORITISATION)</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (INFORMATION SHARING)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (MRE)</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (MRE)</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (DARI)</strong></td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACKGROUND TO THE SURVEY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of the survey</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of survey participants</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTEXT OF MINE ACTION IN AFGHANANATAN</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A GENDER PERSPECTIVE IN MINE ACTION</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GENDER EQUALITY AS AN END IN ITSELF AND A MEANS TO AN END</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GENDER SENSITIVE SURVEYS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>METHODOLOGY AND RESOURCES FOR THE SURVEY</strong></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY APPROACH</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY TOOLS</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELECTION OF COMMUNITIES</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMAN AND MATERIAL RESOURCES</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE TEAMS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY PROCESS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REPORT WRITING</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIMITATIONS OF THE METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SURVEY FINDINGS</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS FROM MINE ACTION</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT SITUATION OF THE FOUR COMMUNITIES SURVEYED</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES ARISING FROM MINE ACTION</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT CHALLENGES AND CONSTRAINTS</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT PRIORITIES OF COMMUNITIES</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEVELOPMENT LINKAGES THAT EXIST OR CAN BE SUPPORTED</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECONOMIC RETURNS TO INVESTMENT IN MINE ACTION</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAND VALUES</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER ECONOMIC BENEFITS</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VALUING SECURITY</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COST OF SURVEY</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRIORITISATION OF MINE ACTION</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRESENT PRIORITY SETTING PROCESSES IN MAPA</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERCEPTION OF PRIORITY SETTING BY SURVEYED COMMUNITIES</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (PRIORITISATION)</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (PRIORITISATION)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHARING AND RECEIVING MINE ACTION INFORMATION WITH WOMEN</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (INFORMATION SHARING)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUALITY MANAGEMENT</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY FINDINGS ON QUALITY MANAGEMENT</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINE RISK EDUCATION</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY FINDINGS ON MRE</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakeeban community, Zendajan District, Herat Province</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qala-i-Shater community, Injil District, Herat Province</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jibrael community, Centre District, Herat Province</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi community, Kohsan District, Herat Province</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS ON MRE FROM WOMEN</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRE PATHWAYS</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSIONS (MRE)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS (MRE)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VICTIM ASSISTANCE (&quot;DISABLED IS NOT UNABLE&quot;)</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE STUDIES OF WOMEN</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE STUDIES OF MEN</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE STUDY OF GIRLS</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE STUDY OF BOYS</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROADENED DEFINITION OF &quot;VICTIM&quot;</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUPPORT FOR THE VICTIMS</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHALLENGES RELATED TO VICTIM ASSISTANCE</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**ACRONYMS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIRD</td>
<td>Afghanistan Institute for Rural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALIS</td>
<td>Afghanistan Landmine Impact Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMAC</td>
<td>Area Mine Action Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMAS</td>
<td>Afghanistan Mine Action Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANBP</td>
<td>Afghanistan’s New Beginnings Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANDMA</td>
<td>Afghanistan Nation Disaster Management Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANDS</td>
<td>Afghanistan National Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AP</td>
<td>Anti-Personnel (mine)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCS</td>
<td>Afghan Red Crescent Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARTF</td>
<td>Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT</td>
<td>Anti-tank (mine)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATC</td>
<td>Afghan Technical Consultants Demining Training Centre, Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAC</td>
<td>Battle Area Clearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBMC</td>
<td>Community-Based Mine Clearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Central Statistics Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDG</td>
<td>Danish Demining Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DMC</td>
<td>Department for Mine Clearance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOTS</td>
<td>Directly Observed Treatment Short-course (Tuberculosis)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOD</td>
<td>Explosive Ordnance Disposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERW</td>
<td>Explosive Remnants of War</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSD</td>
<td>Farming System Diagram</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GICHD</td>
<td>Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Deming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GMAP</td>
<td>Gender and Mine Action Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoA</td>
<td>Government of Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS</td>
<td><em>Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION
The Mine Action Coordination Centre for Afghanistan (MACCA) and the Department for Mine Clearance (DMC) are seeking to better understand the development outcomes of demining. They plan to undertake community-level surveys on a periodic basis to document these achievements and identify changes to policy and practice that could further enhance the contribution that the Mine Action Programme of Afghanistan (MAPA) makes towards Afghanistan’s development. The Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining (GICHD), working within the framework of the MoU between the GICHD and the UN Mine Action Service (UNMAS), assisted with the design and implementation of a pilot project that surveyed 25 communities in the central and northern areas of Afghanistan in 2010. This report describes a second livelihoods survey conducted in 2011 with four mine/ERW-affected communities in the western area in Herat Province.

OBJECTIVES
The purposes of the study were to gain a better understanding of the development outcomes and impacts accruing from demining and how to enhance these through revisions to the criteria used to select priorities, adaptations to the priority-setting process and enhanced linkages with rural and community development organisations. The study also involved Afghan surveyors from Afghan mine action Implementing Partners and social scientists from the Afghan Institute for Rural Development and the Central Statistics Office to develop in-country capacity to conduct and analyses such surveys on a periodic basis. The report is intended to contribute to more complete reporting to the Government of Afghanistan (GoA) and donors on the contribution made by the MAPA to Afghanistan’s development, and to inform the post-clearance survey efforts of demining operators (internal QA) and the MACCA/DMC (external QA plus national standards) on quality at the development outcome level.

METHODS
As preparation for the survey, a 5-day training on livelihoods analysis was attended by the survey teams. Facilitation was provided by international specialists in livelihoods, gender and mine action provided by GICHD and the Gender and Mine Action Programme, and by MACCA HQ staff. The survey used a Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) approach for the community-level survey and analysis work. Within this asset-based approach, a range of Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) tools were applied. The four communities included in this survey were chosen on the basis of security, accessibility, contrast between urban and rural settings, contrast between types of hazard (mines and ERW), and cleared or on-going clearance sites. The communities surveyed were: Qala-i-Shater (Injil District) with 300 families; Jibrael (Centre District) with 800 families; Qalat-i-Ghazi (Kohsan District) with 100 families and Shakeeban (Zendajan District) with 200 families. Each community was visited by a men’s and women’s team over a two-day
period. The information gathered was neither complete nor fully accurate as it depended on the surveyors asking all the questions in their checklists and following up key questions with supplementary “probing” questions, and villagers being able to recall information accurately, completely and honestly.

**MAIN CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING FROM THE SURVEY**

Overall the survey was successful in meeting its objectives, and has gathered a wealth of useful information, providing numerous recommendations for the improvement of mine action in Afghanistan. When taken together with other surveys and audits this provides the evidence needed for decision making and change.

**CONCLUSIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)**

- Clearance enables a wide range of land and non-land activities/employment, encourages investment, reduces fear and enables the return of refugees/IDPs
- Mine action enables better education (building of schools, safer access to schools for children and teachers)
- Mine action enables better health (reduced death and injury; building of clinics and safe access for staff; rehabilitation of water sources)
- Clearance creates opportunities for large scale enterprises (e.g. sugar beet, dairy, brick-making in Qalat-i-Ghazi)
- Homogeneous communities seem most self-reliant and development oriented (community contributions – e.g. Jibrael). Combined with strong, benign leadership from wealthy landowners this can result in accelerated development following the removal of hazards
- The economic value of assets increases dramatically following clearance. As asset values change, there is a need to re-assess crop/livestock returns as a function of land values to see if they are still the most viable option
- Communities and individuals (including victims) need capital/credit to start or expand their businesses
- They also need vocational and literacy training and training facilities
- Daily and seasonal activities vary hugely by gender, age, occupation and wealth, and there are marked gender roles and responsibilities (but these can be flexible according to circumstance)
- Some aid dependence was noted in one community (Qala-i-Shater)
- Few development agencies (government, NGO or private) are active and effective in rural areas

**RECOMMENDATIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)**

- MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints
- The Unit should also conduct economic analysis of development options so as to be able to give appropriate advice to agencies
• The Unit should consider the considerable diversity within and between communities (gender, age, wealth, ethnicity, environmental, political...), and adapt tools and activities accordingly
• Mine action and development should be linked through the coordination of communication, monitoring, research and development initiatives between focal points in a network of relevant development agencies (government, NGO, private, donor) by the MAPA Liaison Officer
• An initial step in developing this coordinated network could be the training of the 22 existing focal points and other key people in a workshop designed to ensure the focal persons understand the relationships between mine action activities and improved livelihoods for community members
• Information related to development needs and priorities should be shared with development organizations to strengthen the link between mine action and development
• In order to maximize the developmental benefits for women, ensure their development priorities are taken into account in information gathering prioritization processes and in post clearance activities, and that all information is disaggregated by sex and age
• The video materials obtained during the survey should be reviewed (perhaps together with still photographs taken during the two L&L surveys) to make a short film that illustrates: a) the tools used in the survey; b) the impact of mine action on rural and urban communities. The film can be used for training and for advocacy.

CONCLUSIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
Although the amount of quantitative data collected by the survey teams was insufficient in most cases, the land value data suggests that demining in these four communities has been, on balance, a sound investment in economic terms.

RECOMMENDATIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
• the MACCA and the GICHD should investigate secondary sources for (i) farming systems studies and (ii) land values
• the MACCA and the GICHD should conduct a second workshop on ‘good enough’ economic analysis of demining projects for social scientists from AIRD, and for senior personnel in the MACCA and the MAPA partners who are responsible for socio-economic surveys or heavily involved in planning and prioritisation
• the MACCA and the MAPA partners should re-assess their survey forms for quantitative socio-economic data, modify it if necessary based on the outcomes of the economic analysis workshop, and re-train survey teams to ensure they can bring back adequate quantitative data for analysis.

---

1 Cartagena Action Plan Action # 25: Collect and analyse all necessary data in a sex and age disaggregated manner
2 A preliminary workshop was held in March 2011 following the stakeholders workshop for the initial L&L Survey.
CONCLUSIONS (PRIORITISATION)

Although the results from only four communities out of a total of 2115 impacted communities in Afghanistan could not provide a full understanding of people’s perception on priority setting process of MAPA, they indicate that the people have no complaints and are happy with the process. The findings of the survey encourage MACCA and the DMC to retain the criteria used for selection of the areas for clearance; however the recommendations below will further improve the process:

RECOMMENDATIONS (PRIORITISATION)

• MAPA should give similar priority to mental trauma caused by accidents as to physical injury (the bombardment of Qala-i-Shater provides a good example of long-term mental trauma)
• The suggestions made by local people on accelerating the process of clearing the remaining contaminated areas within their communities should be gathered and acted upon where appropriate
• There should be an annual review of local clearance priorities through liaison with the communities; thus, MACCA can ensure community involvement and can have a better understanding of the on-going needs of the communities affected by mines/ERW.
• Demining organizations should consult with communities as part of the process of selection of the next areas for clearance, and should be aware of village development plans (e.g. planned location of new schools etc.)
• Since women, girls, boys and men (and also poorer and better off people) within a community have different exposure to hazards; separate meetings should be conducted with different groups in order to make sure their needs are addressed
• All information should be collected and analysed in a sex and age disaggregated manner, in order to take into account the different priorities of all age and sex groups
• Female MA staff members should be deployed when collecting prioritization-related information from affected communities, facilitating the access to female community members
• Women should be ensured meaningful participation at priority-setting meetings and their views should be taken into account and reflected in the final ranking of priorities
• Considering the daily and seasonal activities of female and male community members will help understand when is a good time to arrange meetings to find out about their clearance priorities
• Analyzing the past recorded civilian accidents will help to find out in which season of the year the people mostly become landmine victims. The findings can be fed into clearance operations and MRE messages.
RECOMMENDATIONS (INFORMATION SHARING)

- Improve access to women through the deployment of female mine action staff members
- Ensure women receive first-hand information, through female mine action staff reaching out to women and sharing information directly
- Ensure women are included in handover procedures, and that they receive first-hand information related to which areas have been cleared, and which are safe to use
- Monitor information sharing with women and men post clearance through post clearance sex disaggregated community data
- Organize meetings with community women, utilizing local structures like women’s Shura. This can be an effective way of reaching out to, and including women, taking into consideration their needs, priorities and capabilities
- Ensure information sharing is age and gender sensitive, taking into consideration the level of education and illiteracy issues

CONCLUSIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)

MACCA has been successful with the QA and QC of the outputs of demining operations. Where there have been quality problems in the de-mining operation, these have been investigated and rectified. However, the lessons learned from these investigations and records of QA and QC have not been properly tracked for avoiding further undesired events.

In Jibrael there were mine accidents following supposed clearance. However, this was due to exceptional circumstances (deeply buried mines [by wind-blown soils and flood sediments] and the construction of buildings requiring deep foundations and heavy machinery). In correct fashion, an enquiry was held and a second clearance is underway which has found only one mine.

RECOMMENDATIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)

- Establish a strong quality management process that focuses not only on the quality of the actual clearance operations, but also ensures that clearance is “fit for purpose” – i.e. it takes into account the intended use of the cleared land.
- Continue strengthening processes (e.g. livelihoods and PDIA surveys and the use of the Balanced Scorecard approach) that assess post-handover outcomes, impacts and opportunities
- Add a strong, clear and routine community liaison process to the QA process of MACCA QM to ensure involvement of female and male community members in mine action planning, implementation and outcome assessment
- Include QA of victim assistance activities in MACCA QM as these are poor at present.

---

3 Cartagena Action Plan, Action Point # 15: *Involve women and men in handover*
CONCLUSIONS (MRE)

• All villages received some MRE (men, girls and boys more than the women).
• Coverage is not complete. Not all children attend school and many women have restricted mobility
• There is no evidence of female MRE staff interacting with female community members in three of the four communities

RECOMMENDATIONS (MRE)

• Recognise and take into consideration MRE accessibility challenges for women and girls when planning MRE visits
• Ensure MRE activities take into account the particular exposure of boys and men, and that activities at the time of accident are recorded when collecting accident data, in order to enable the tailoring and targeting of MRE to gender related exposure and behavior
• Consider and use the KAPB-related information on women and girls, and make sure MRE activities are tailored and designed on the basis of this information, taking into consideration female-specific roles and responsibilities that result in exposure to landmines/ERW\(^4\)
• Design and implement MRE activities, recognizing the seasonal variations in all community members’ gender specific roles and responsibilities
• Conduct MRE follow-up sessions, in particular in Qalat-i-Ghazi and Qala-i-Shater focusing on risky behaviour
• Ministry of Education should take more responsibilities in areas where the MAPA MRE resources are not available.
• Further develop the MRE multi-media campaign to reach more people through different channels
• Deploy all-female MRE teams in order to ensure female community members are directly included in MRE activities
• Identify and train female MRE volunteers wherever possible and teachers in affected communities within government networks (NSP, local network and MoPH health workers)
• Ensure that MRE is communicated through gender and age sensitive channels, and that challenges like illiteracy, which is highly gendered, is taken into consideration when designing MRE materials
• Include more specific questions on MRE when designing future surveys. The survey teams must understand the questions and must provide a full set of data to facilitate the report writing.

\(^4\) Cartagena Action Plan Action # 52: ... assistance should be based on appropriate surveys, needs analysis, age-appropriate and gender sensitive strategies
CONCLUSIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)

- Most accidents occurred spring and summer; men are at greatest risk. The smaller number of children injured might reflect successful MRE
- Both mental and physical trauma (e.g. Qala-i-Shater)
- Little government support to survivors or indirect victims
- Patchy and inconsistent VA (that relies on broader disability services) is failing both direct and indirect victims

RECOMMENDATIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)

- Apply the official definition of “victim”, ensuring indirect victims are included (recognizing CCM’s broadened definition of “victim” 5) in any VA related activities, and that all victims’ needs and priorities are taken into consideration in an age and gender sensitive way
- Collect victim data, disaggregated by sex and age
- Develop a register of all direct and indirect landmine/ERW victims
- Link victims to support organisations, including MoLSAMD, MoE, MoPH
- Support these organisations through advocacy, training and technical assistance
- Recognise and take into consideration accessibility issues of female survivors and victims when designing and implementing VA activities
- Deploy female VA staff members to ensure affected women and girls can be reached (for example through house to house visits), and that their needs and priorities are taken into consideration
- Advocate the Afghanistan government, and remind it of its treaty obligations under the APMBC and the CCM, to ensure that all mine/ERW victims and persons with disabilities have equal and full access to adequate, affordable, gender and age sensitive emergency and continued medical care, physical rehabilitation, psychosocial support, social and economic inclusion services and legal assistance 6
- Sensitize affected women about their rights, and ensure any sensitization campaigns are carried out in an age and gender sensitive manner, taking into consideration illiteracy and access issues.

CONCLUSIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)

A combination of MACCA, DMC and AIRD support would still be needed to design, implement, analyse and report similar L&L surveys in the future. However, it is felt that this could now be achieved without the need for involvement of international scientists.

---

5 Victim means: “all persons who have been killed or suffered physical or psychological injury, economic loss, social marginalisation or substantial impairment of the realisation of their rights caused by the use of cluster munitions. They include those persons directly impacted by cluster munitions as well as their affected families and communities.” Convention on Cluster Munitions, Article 2, May 2008. http://www.clusterconvention.org/files/2011/01/Convention-ENG.pdf

6 Cartagena Action Plan, Action # 31: Ensure appropriate services are available and accessible to female and male victim
RECOMMENDATIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)

• Conduct a further small pilot L&L survey using Afghan personnel for all aspects.
• As recommended in the section on Development Outcomes, MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints
• Continue, and build on, the partnership with AIRD
• Training in L&L should be provided to the 22 existing focal points and other key people to widen the understanding of livelihoods and development across relevant Afghan organisations.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (DARI)

خلاصه اجرایی

مقدمه:
مرکز مهاجرتی امور مادی پاکی افغانستان (MACCA) و ریاست انجام تطبیقی‌های (DMC) در تلاش‌آند تا درک خوبی
از دستاوردهای ماهی‌های داشته باشند. این پیان دادن چه مسوولیت زمینی را از سطح جوامع انجام دهد و این
دستاوردها را مستند نموده و تغییرات دربالامی و عمل را نشاندهنیم. نموده و سهم گرای پروگرام‌های پاکی افغانستان
را درک کرده افغانستان بیشتر تقویمانی. مرکز بین المللی جنگ برای مانی پاکی بشر (MAPA) (GICHD)
یک تفکر انگیزه ای ان درمان و خدمات مانی پاکی ملی متحد (UNMAS) کار نموده و دربرخ و عملی نموده یک پروژه
ازمانسلی که طی این 25 کامکرد و شمار افغانستان در تاریخ 2010 سری در کمک نموده است. این راپور سری
دوامی می‌شود را که در سال 2011 در جهان جامعه مرتب شده ازمانی و مهمات منطقه ناشنو نه‌گرای(هرات) انجام
یافت نشان می‌کند.

اهداف:
اهداف این سرویس یک نود ناگه برتری از استانداردها و تاثیرات انکشاف که در تنزلی پاکی واقع شده بست این واینکه
چطور آنها را تولید می‌رساند معیار‌های که برای انتخاب اصلی دری در سرویس پرواز افغانستان از همکاران عملیاتی منسوب
منشأین علوم اجتماعی از دادن افغانستان واداره مرکزی احتمالی جهت رشد علمی دانشگاه برای
اجرا تحلیل چینی سرویس‌های این باید بی‌توجه زمانی باشد دانشی. این راپور جهت پژوهش در گزارش دهی کمک
به حکومت افغانستان و این مجموعه کنترل قدرت سرمایه پروگرام پاکی افغانستان به انکشاف افغانستان و جهت
عکس‌گیری زمان آزمایش بعد از ایجاد کاری در مورد تلاش ها در ارتباط با اطمنان از کنترل کنیت داهی توسط منسوب
توجه کننده و اطمنان از کنترل کنیت طراحی جمع معیار معاله ملی توسط مرکز مهاجرتی امور مادی پاکی و ریاست انجام
طبیعی‌های نیازی که کار مانی پاکی نه‌گرای است.

روش‌کاری:
چیه آماده گر سرویس پکورس اموزشی پنج روزه مورد معیشت برای تم‌های سروی القا داده‌نشده شد تسهیلات در
دیوانی کورس اموزشی در مورد معیشت، جنگی و وغلیت‌های مانی پاکی و مراکز دفتر
مرکزی مهاجرتی امور مادی پاکی (MACCA)

این سرویس روی معیشت پاپیدر را برای سرویک و کار تحلیل به سوی جامعه بکارت بر. در ضمن این رو شکایت بر دارایی
یک سلسله طرفی (سابی) از ایجاد یک داده علمی گردد. چهارده که در این سرویس شمار بود بر اساس انتخاب،
یک گروه تحقیق بین شهروند افتاده، به عنوان مصاحبه که جامعه با در ارتباط اید (مانی) و مواد منطقه بالاینامه از
جنگ و ساکنات پاپ شده و ساکن به سوی کاری در این جریان دارنده گردیده‌بود.

جواهر که سرویس گردد عبارت از : قایق‌های (پلیم‌های انگلیس) با 300 خانواده، 3 برای (پلیم‌های مرکزی) با 800
خانواده، خانواده، (پلیم‌های کویسن) با 200 خانواده، 4 برای جمعه توسط
یک تیم مردایه و زنان در طی دو روز دیگر در جمع آوری مدادی و کاملاً دیق نگهداری که سرویس
کاندا گان مکتی بر پرستش های بودن که درک نتایج در این سوالات عمده (اسکلی) توسط سوالات اضافی
(ایمانی) تغییر می‌شود تا دهاتان یا بست معلومات را بصورت دقیق، کمک و صادقانه بیان اند.:

سری متابولیسم:
بطرکی سرویس در دسترس ای بردی شده اما اهداف خود موفق بوده، یک ذخیره معلومات می‌فاده این جمع آوری نمود، سفارشات
زبان را درک کرده‌اند مانی پاکی در افغانستان تهیه نمود. اگرتریسی به وسریسی های دیکگیچا در بیان‌گفتگه شود این
شواهدی را برهم‌بستن که برای تصمیم گیری و تغییر ضرورت نیاز می‌شود.
نتایج (دستاوردها و تاثیر اکتشافی)

عملیات ماین پاکی عاملیت‌های اکتشافی گزارش می‌گردد. همچنین در زمین‌های گزارش و فعالیت‌ها در اینجا که در متن ذکر شده است.

فصل آموزشی گزارش می‌پذیرد و به‌طور مداوم باعث جمع‌آوری تغییرات در انتقال‌ها و تغییرات در انتقال‌ها و همچنین در زمین‌های گزارش و فعالیت‌های اکتشافی گزارش می‌گردد.

جدید ساخته‌های اکتشافی (جوامع، موسیقی غیردولتی با حضوری) در راه انداخته و موسیقی‌های اکتشافی گزارش می‌گردد.

سفارشات (دستاوردها و تاثیر اکتشافی)

پروگرام ماین پاکی اکتشافی (MAPA) یکی از نتایجی بود که در نظر گرفته و با همکاری استیتیون اکتشاف دهات اکتشافی (لا کاراکتیریستیک ویدیو) طریق زمین‌ها و همچنین انتقال‌های اکتشافی گزارش می‌گردد.

بونت مکاکی باید تحلیل اقتصادی گرزه‌های اکتشافی را اجرا می‌کند و تا مصرف مناسب باید موسیقی‌های کرده در اینجا برد.

بونت مکاکی باید متوقف بین جوامع مختلف و در داخل هر جمعه را از دستگاه‌ها (جنسیت، سن، دارایی، میت، محیط) و اقتصادی گردیده و در نظر گرفته می‌باشد. آن فعالیت و روش‌های حقیقی خود را اجرای نماید.

پروگرام ماین پاکی اکتشافی برای بچه‌ها و بچگانه‌ها اکتشافی ارتقاء و گردش انتقال‌های اکتشافی بین نماهنگ‌ها و همچنین در اینجا برد.

توسعه کارمند ارتقاء و در مورد ماین پاکی اکتشافی ارتقاء داشته باشد.

یک مدل در اکتشاف عمدا ساخته‌های ماین پاکی و می‌تواند در دسترس و در دسترس منابع فرهنگی اکتشافی با پروگرام ماین پاکی و اکتشاف گردش ما را پذیرفته، ابزار و ابزار همکاری با این موضوعات، و از ملیت‌های اکتشافی به صورتی که در انتقال‌های اکتشافی بین نماهنگ‌ها و همچنین در اینجا برد.

برای اینکه اکتشافی برهه اعضا برند باید اولیت‌های اکتشافی آنها در برنامه جمع آوری معلومات، پروگرام ماین पاکی و اکتشاف گردش ما را پذیرفته، ابزار و ابزار همکاری با این موضوعات، و از ملیت‌های اکتشافی به صورتی که در انتقال‌های اکتشافی بین نماهنگ‌ها و همچنین در اینجا برد.

7. پلان عملياتي كارتاجنی، فعالیت نمره 25: "همه معلومات ضروری براساس جنسیت و سن بطور مجزا.

8. جمع آوری شود."
بازیاب گرفتن ها، از ابتدای زمینه به زبان عکس هایی که در انتهای دو سروی ماین

• 

• ویکبیدویی که در انتایی سروی گرفته شده باید بازیابی شود.

• معیشت گرفته شده اند) نازلی یک فرم کوچک ساخته شده که بیانگر افزایش ظرفیت است.

• (ب) نژادشناسی های ماین پایک باید جوامع روستایی و شهری.

• فرم مسیری که می تواند برای امور زمین و دفاع از مزراع ماین پایک استعمل گردد.

نتایج (عفاید اقتصادی)

• با وجود که در بررسی از موارد مقدار معمولاً کمیتی جمع آوری شده توسط تم سروی ناگفته بود اما ارقام

• ارزش زمین این واکنش مسیر ماین پایک در جوامع مزراع ماین از اقتصادی یک سرمایه

• گزاری درست و بجا بوده است.

سفارشات (عفاید اقتصادی)

• دفتر ماهنگی امورمناد پایک (MACCA) و مرکز ملی جنوب برای ماین پایک شهری (GICHĐ)

• جهت مالامله بتهت: (الف) سیستم های قارم داری (ب) ارزش زمین، رو های عملی دیگری را جستجو و

• تطبیق دیالیک.

• مرکز ماهنگی امورمناد پایک و مرکز ملی جنوب برای ماین پایک باید یک و یک تأثیرگذاری را در مورد

• تحلیل اقتصادی "کافی توان" برای ماین پایک برای تنظیمی اجتماعی استیتاقت اکتشاف دهات و

• برای اعضای اراض مرکز ماهنگی و همکاران پروگرام ماین پایک افغانستان و ساختنیکه سیستمیت سرویس های

• اجتماعی و اقتصادی را دارد و با عملیات اولیه بندی ویلدرگانی عمقی دیگری اند داریم.

• مرکز ماهنگی امورمناد پایک و همکاران تطبیق کنند، باید نظر های سروی خود را جهت ارقام کمی اجتماعی –

• اقتصادی دباده مور نموده و درصد در حرکت بررسی و استواردهتی ارکن تحلیل اقتصادی آنها را امکان

• داده و تیم های سروی را اموزش دوبار دهنده، تامپیشن شوند که اینا سفارشات نتیجه بررسی مزراع را جهت حذف ارقام

• ارورده می توانند.

نتایج (اوولویت نیدی)

• با وجود که نتایج فقط چهار اجتماع ازجمله 1151 اجتماع متأثرشد به توانایی کشوری که توانایی کشوری درک

• نظریات مسر درباره عملی اولویت بندی پروگرام ماین پایک افغانستان تهیه می‌شود، اما با وجود این نتایج مزراع

• نشان می‌دهد که مزراع در بندی عملی مزراع افزایشات نداشت و به این خواسته، دریافت‌های سرویس

• مرکز ماهنگی امورمناد پایک و ریاست اسناد محققان را تشویق می‌کند که معنی‌های راک دانای انتخاب

• ساحت جهت ماین پایک بکار برده دوم دهه (الف قلی) اما سفارشات نزل پروس مزراع را بیشتر بهبود خواهد

• پیشنهاد.

سفارشات (اوولویت نیدی)

• پرورش ماین پایک افغانستان باید اولویت مشابه را برای بررسی روی که توسط حداکثر هم بوده مانند زخم

• (های فیزیکی (جسمانی) کلیت شد (بتارف لغت شریک می‌شود) در بندی تربیت میشود. اما با وجود این نتایج مزراع

• پیشنهادهای مزراع در مورد بررسی عملیات ماین پایک ساحت‌های در جوامع شان تا هزینه میان پایک شده اند باید

• جمع اوری زمین و اجرای منظمی به‌طور مناسب عملی گردید.

• یک بررسی سالانه اولویت های پایاکسی در ماهنگی باجوعه باید بسته به اجتماعی و اقتصادی مزراع کلمه مزراع

• امورمناد پایک که می تواند دخیل بودن جوامع را در غرفه عملی قدرتی زمین و می‌تواند بسته به جوامع مزراع

• نظام (فلکی) جوامع که توسط مزراع متأثر می‌گردد از مزراعات بهتری شود.

• موسمان ماین پایک باید مشترکه جوامع را منحصراً به‌طور زیر استفاده می‌کنند که برای اولویت کاری

• در نظر داشته باشد برای اولویت باجوعه اکتشافی قربه (بطور مثال موقتی پلن شده مكتب نخسی خودگرده) باغی‌رها.

• جنگ خانم، خاتم، خانم، خاتم، خاتم و مردان (نه کشور) به‌طور کمتری راه‌بردی قربه بطور متفاوت مربع موجود

• خطرات قرارگیری مورد محققان جدایی دارد و تا پیشی گردد که مزراعات هم آنها

• منظورگرتفه شده است.
تمام معلومات بديده فشارية بدنية وأدوات تشخيص جنسي وتنحيل گردید تا درناظر داشت اولیات های گروه های مختلف جنسی وسیع پیشنهاد گردید.

- دردشناس جمع هم اکثر موارد رفتاده به اولیات بدنی جوامع متاثره شده باید کارکنان شورا از منظرات پایک توزیع گردد.
- تا به ترتیب همکاری جوامع دسترسی (سامان) داشته باشد.

- همگی فعالیت‌های همه روزه و معمولی اعضای مردان و زنانه یک جامعه کمک خواهند کرد تا دریافت که وقت مناسب ملاقات با اینها در مردم اولیه‌ها یک پایک آنها می‌تواند است.

- تحلیل حادثات تبیه قبیل مردان ملکی کمک که قنادی که درک داده مسلم سال مردم محل زیادتر قربانی (MRE) مایه‌ای زیبایی می‌شود. این دریافت می‌تواند دریک‌ها در امتیاز ماندن پایک وتعلیمات خطرمای (MRE) شامل آنها شود.

نتائج (شرکت سازی و تفکر ملکی اولیه‌ها)

- طوای و اندوه می‌گیرد که در مردم تفکر سازی و تفکر ملکی‌ها اولیه‌ها می‌تواند یک مشکل خاص وجود است و تعلیم که می‌گذر یک کارکنان ملکی یکی مهم‌ترین امکانات مورد استفاده دست از طریق کارکنان ملکی یکی می‌تواند این ادعای موجود نداید. این مسائل بودن از مشترکه و ساختار و مدل مورد هنر مثبت وجود که معنای ملکی‌ها می‌باشد. دریک ذهن نه خاکی اکثریت از نیت مثبتی با این خواهند کرد تا دریافت ساخته‌شده.

- مفهوم پایک ملکی‌ها می‌باشد. این دریافت می‌تواند دریک‌ها در امتیاز ماندن پایک وتعلیمات خطرمای (MRE) شامل آنها شود.

سفرشات (شرکت سازی و تفکر ملکی اولیه‌ها)

- زمینه‌سازی دسترسی خانم‌ها به معلومات اولیه توسط استفاده کارکنان ملکی یکی مهم‌ترین مشکلات می‌باشد. خانم‌ها هم اکثریت معلومات کسب کرده‌اند، این مسائل بودن حضور خانم‌ها و مناسبی که به سادگی و سادگی و یک همکاری که پایک یکی از درمان اولیه و استفاده مصنوعی است. به‌طور آنها می‌تواند از طریق اینکه در اولیه راه‌های براساس جنسیت مجزا گردیده بررسی نمایند.

- باختم‌های جمعه‌ها و عضویت نموده و برای این هدف از مشابهاتی محلی مانند شورای زنان استفاده شود. این یک مطالعه مورد است. که نیاز استفاده آن به خانم‌ها دسترسی به نموده و ضروریت آنها را منظور گرفت.

- مطمئن بودن از مشترکه تفکر ملکی‌ها از نگاه جنسیت و پیسی مشعل حساس است و در این مورد سویی تعلیمی موضوعات بسیاری منظور گرفته شود.

نتایج (اداره کیفیت)

- مرکز‌های مهاجران ملکی یکی افغانستان در ارتباط به اطلاعات کیفی (QA) و کنترل کیفیت (QC) دستورداده‌های عملاط یکی موفق بوده است. در پیجاهه که در مردم عملیات ملکی یکی موجود بوده‌اند، نکاتی به اصلاح شده‌اند. اما تجربیه که از این بازارسی به ویرکاری‌های اطلاعی تضمین که کیفیت وکتورل کیفیت یاد گرفته‌شده بوده و منابع مشابه به‌طور مناسب به‌پی نشده‌است از وقوع حادثات ناخواسته جلوگیری شود.

- پلان عملیاتی کارگانیان فعالیت‌های ۱۵: خانم‌ها و مرد می‌را در تسهیل گیری و تعلیمی دهی شاقی‌سازی
• درقربة جبرانيك بعث تحذيرات من انتشار عمليات مكاسب ماليات خاطئة ما يداعبه است. أما ما تقدمه نظرية شرايط استثماري بوده (ماين)

• تدور ياك كار في جردة نتائج أنه فقط يك ماين ديبادج في.

سفارشات (ادارة كيفيت)

• تاصيب يك برست قوى اداره كيفيت هناك كيفيت عمليات حقيقية ياك ماين را رمضان يكماك را راحم

• تضمين كمية كه ماين ياك ب "هدف سازگار است" به اي معيي كه استعمال مورد نظام يكماك بده

• فروم ناول بيو روسشه ها با رنگKEN مثلا قسمتي از اياکساسي ساحات ياك شده

• كيي (Balance Scorecard) واستعمال ورقه تعادل اميتاب (QM) كيي) تا دخيل بودن مدان ونظام جامعه را دريلن گاري، اجراء وارضایی دستوردهای ماين ياك

• تضمین نمای.

• شامل نمونه اطمنان كيفيت (QA) فعالیت های کمک به قربانیان در بررسی كيفيت پرونگرام مای پاک.

نتایج (تعليمات خطر مان)

• تمام افراص جات تعليمات خطر مان را فرضه بودند (مردان، دختران و بچه بیضیارزغی)

• بررسی تعليمات خطر مان مکمل نیست. مخصوصا اطفالی که مکتب نمی‌روند و خانم های که گفت و گذار شان محدود است تعليمات را قرار دهی. 

• انجام‌آن چهار جوامع درسه جامعه آن کدام شرایط تعليمات خطر مان توسط خانم به اعضا زنان به جامعه دیده نه.

ش.س.ز.م

سفارشات (تعليمات خطر مان)

• دراثی درلکنگاری ملاقات های تعليمات خطر مان چاله‌ی های دسترسی خانم و دختران به تعليمات خطر مان

• راهنمایشه و م italiane فرستاده شود.

• اطمنان از اینکه فعالیت های تعليمات خطر مان با دبیرستان و مرکز عفونیتانا به درپرداختن عداورد، در ارائه ارقيگارگرفتن شود، تا با درپرداختن آن تعليمات خطر مان نظریه(ع.م.)

• استفاده علمیه‌ها به نسبت امرز (محدود) در موارد زنان و دخترین، اطمنان ار اینکه فعالیت های تعليمات خطر مان نظر به معلومات مکون مرز و دیگر این

• گرد و عفونیتانا نش و فعالیت‌های مختصر به زنان و در دبیرستان قرارگرفتن آن چه با نیست و مجله‌نگاره بقا مانده

• طرح و اجرا فعالیت های تعليمات خطر مانی، سناسای هیات به‌عنوان درجه‌ی جامعه نظر به نقش وفعقلیات اس.

• مختص به بست اعضای آن.

• اجرای شست‌های تعیین تعليمات خطر مانی، بخصوص درخواست غازی و دانه سلگس و ورخار

• برخورداری می‌کردمنه‌گرفته شود(متمرکزتیاز).

• درجاهای که تعليمات خطر مان پرپراگرام مای افغانستان موجود بیست و دوازده سالیان ویژه به عده‌ی گرد.

• کمیابی تعليمات خطر مان از طریق مطبوعات بین‌ملی شده شود تا از طریق چینل های مختلف به مردم بیشتر رسدی‌گی سورت گیرد.
نتایج (کمک به قربانیان)

بحث از حادثات در بمب و حملات واقع می‌شود، موردی بی‌شمار در معرض خطر قرار دادن. موجودیت تعداد کم
اطفال زخمی شاد این اکثریت کننده موفقیت تعیین خطر ماین باشد
هردو یا یکنواحی و Fuß (تمار مثال فاقد شرکت) و
حمایت از شهدا حکومت به زندان داده‌گان و قربانیان غیرمستقیم
کمک از اینک ادک و متناقض به قربانیان (که ممکن بر خریده و سه معیوبیت است) برای قربانیان مستقیم و غیر مستقیم خیلی ضعیف بوده است.

سفارشات (کمک به قربانیان)

• تعیین یافته "میراثی" را یکبار برده شده و اطمنان حاصل شود که قربانیان غیر مستقیم در آن دخیل بانند
• نشانی‌گیری قربانیان در قبیل خودش در این "CCM" (کامیون) متوجه به قربانیان 10 نفر بکره شده است) در هر
• فعالیت کمک به قربانیان و در این صورت و اولویت قربانیان به روش متناسب به جنگی و سن در نظر
• گرفته شود.
• جمع اوری ارقام قربانیان بطور مجزا بر اساس جنسیت و سن
• یک راه‌سرشته تمام قربانیان ماین و مواد مشابه باید بررسی گردد
• قربانیان با ماهنیت‌های مرمت امکان احتمال، افزایش و مفعالیت وزارت فعالیت به صورت واحد
• ارتباط داده و (معروف گردد)
• موسسات ملی از طریق و کمیتی، اموزش و گرده گردن‌های تشفیه‌گیری ممکن است.
• در انتظار طرح و اجرای فعالیت‌های کمک به قربانیان دیده‌ای اثری سرطانی قربانیان، وزنه دندان گان زنانه
• شناسایی شده و در نظر گرفته شود.

استخدام کارگران زنانه کمک به قربانیان تا به زنان و دختران متاهل شده رسفته گی سه بشنوید (بطور مثال از طریق
• مقاتلات های خانه به خانه)، و اینکه این بالیندیها و دیگر مواد به قربانیان وارد گردند.
• حمایت دولت افغانستان از قربانیان ویژه از مسولیت دولت در قبال معاهده بهره‌برداری علیه ماین های ضد
• پروپاگاند انتخابه (CCM) و پیمان موانع خونه بی (APMBC) و تجلیلی سماوی و کامل تمام قربانیان ماین
• و مواد مشابه باید بررسی قربانیان جنگ و اشخاص معوب باید مطلوب جنبه و سرخ به کمک های عاجل، موافقت مشابه
• صحی، احیا مجدد فزایقی، حمایت روانی، خدمات اعم از اجتماعی و اقتصادی و حمایت حقوقی تضمین
• گردد11.
نتایج (رشد ظرفیت)

شرکت مسابقه و حمایت مرکز هم‌اکنونی امور ماین پاکی (MACCA) و (DMC) و انستیتوت انکشاف دهات افغانستان (AIRD) ضرورت خواهید بود تا سروی ها به ارتباط ماین و معیشت را بدون دخیل بوده متخصصین بین المللی طرح، تحلیل و رایور دهد.

سفارشات (رشد ظرفیت)

انجام دادن یک سروی دیگر کامپیوتری از ماین و معیشت و با رساندن افغانیان در تمام امور این بخش در دستور دارندهای انکشاف شده در یک گروه امنیت ماین پاکی افغانستان به تأسیس یک پارک تحقیق و انکشاف را در مرکز هم‌اکنونی امور ماین پاکی در ایتالیا و یک پارک تحقیق و انکشاف دهات افغانستان (AIRD) که آنها می‌توانند طرح‌های بهتری برای انکشاف پایدار سروی های دیگر را انجام داده‌های نظامی افغانستان را بیشتر باور کنند.

اموری در بخش ماین و معیشت برای 22 نام‌برد موجود و مداخله مردم به توجه به داشت (رشد ظرفیت) شان در مورد ماین و معیشت در سراسر موسسات مربوطه (حکومت، توسعه کنندگان، موسسات غیر دولتی و خصوصی).
INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND TO THE SURVEY
The Mine Action Coordination Centre for Afghanistan (MACCA) and the Department for Mine Clearance (DMC) are seeking to better understand the development outcomes of demining. They plan to undertake community-level surveys on a periodic basis to document these achievements and identify changes to policy and practice that could further enhance the contribution that the Mine Action Programme of Afghanistan (MAPA) makes towards Afghanistan’s development.

Recently, MACCA and DMC have initiated the following:
- Post-Demining Impact Assessments (PDIA) – task-level assessments of demined mine fields (MF) and battle fields (BF), planned by MACCA and implemented by Landmine Impact Assessment Teams (LIAT) from MCPA
- Post-Demining Audits (PDA) – task-level audits of demined hazards undertaken by DMC to assess safety, the use of the land, and the satisfaction of the community and local government officials with the demining process
- Landmines and Livelihoods (L&L) Surveys – community-level assessments of mine-affected communities to assess the (i) impact of contamination, (ii) impact of demining, (iii) use of the unblocked land, (iv) community satisfaction, and (v) community development priorities.

The first two collect mainly quantitative data on tasks, while the third (this survey) has been designed to collect mainly qualitative data on communities.

The Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining (GICHD), working within the framework of the MoU between the GICHD and the UN Mine Action Service (UNMAS), assisted with the design and implementation of a pilot project that surveyed 25 communities in the central and northern areas of Afghanistan in 2010. The survey findings were presented to a range of government, donor and NGO stakeholders in February 2011. It was decided at that time to incorporate feedback and experience from the first survey into a second survey. Accordingly, the MACCA requested GICHD to organise a second L&L survey, with an emphasis on further developing local capacities to plan, implement, analyse and report further surveys in Afghanistan. The survey was subsequently conducted by teams of male and female surveyors in four communities of Herat Province in October 2011.
OBJECTIVES OF THE SURVEY

The overarching objective - is to enhance the socio-economic benefits accruing from mine action, particularly in rural Afghanistan.

Goal – To enhance the prioritisation and Quality Management (QM) systems of the Mine Action Programme of Afghanistan (MAPA)

Purposes:
1. Learning – to gain a better understanding of the development outcomes and impacts accruing from demining and how to enhance these through:
   a. revisions to the criteria used to select priorities
   b. adaptations to the priority-setting process
   c. enhanced linkages with rural and community development organisations

2. Capacity development – ensure the MAPA, in partnership with Afghan social scientists, can conduct such surveys on a periodic basis and analyse the data using the SL model and, specifically, to:
   a. provide further training for surveyors from the MAPA in data collection using the Landmine and Livelihoods (L&L) approach
   b. introduce additional Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) tools to allow MACCA, DMC and IPs to use L&L surveys in support of a variety of objectives (e.g. community needs assessments as well as post-demining assessments)
   c. conduct a small (e.g. seven communities) L&L survey for practical training of the surveyors and social scientists, test new PRA tools, and obtain L&L data
   d. train and mentor Afghan social scientists in the analysis and reporting of L&L data using the Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) model
   e. obtain farming systems data from secondary sources for use in Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) of demining.
3. **Enhanced accountability** – more complete reporting to the Government of Afghanistan (GoA) and donors on the contribution made by the MAPA to Afghanistan’s development.

4. **Quality Management** – inform the post-clearance survey efforts of demining operators (internal QA) and the MACCA/DMC (external QA plus national standards) on quality at the development outcome level.

**TRAINING OF SURVEY PARTICIPANTS**

As preparation for the survey, a 5-day training of the survey teams was held in the premises of the Western Area Mine Action Centre (AMAC) in Herat from October 2011. The training was attended by Afghan mine action Implementing Partners (selected from the HALO Trust, DDG, OMAR, ARCS), MCPA, the DMC, the Afghanistan Institute for Rural Development (AIRD) and the Central Statistics Organisation (CSO). Facilitation was provided by international specialists in livelihoods, gender and mine action provided by GICHD and the Gender and Mine Action Programme (GMAP), and by MACCA HQ staff. Annex One provides a list of the participants and facilitators. The main objectives of the training were to:

- Gain a common understanding of the task
- Understand the principles, approaches and tools to be used in the survey
- Practice the tools and skills that will be used in the survey
- Agree on teams, roles, equipment, timetable and logistics for the survey.

The training covered the following topics:

- The SL approach
- Gender and mine action
- SL analysis tools
- Quantitative data for the economic analysis of mine action
- Land allocation and land use questions
- Logistics of the survey

The training course content can be found in a separate document (*Report on Training on the use of Livelihood Survey Tool, October 2011*).

---

12 The SL approach fits well with mine action because it is an asset-based approach (and landmines/ ERW block safe access to assets) and it is effective at the community level (thus meshing with Community Impact scoring used in mine action).
Mixed group work during the training in Heart

**CONTEXT OF MINE ACTION IN AFGHANISTAN**

As of 31\textsuperscript{st} March 2011 (the end of 1389), Afghanistan’s 6,545 known minefields covered 627sq km of land throughout the country. Although the casualty rate has reduced dramatically to 550 victims of landmines and ERW in 1389 from a high of 2,116 nine years ago, Afghanistan is still one of the most heavily impacted countries in the world. Consistently, children bear the heaviest burden in terms of casualties (MACCA Annual Report, 1389).

The most recent government endorsed strategy document for mine action was issued in May 2006. It was based on the Government of Afghanistan’s vision of

> “a country free from landmines and explosive remnants of war (ERW), where people and communities live in a safe environment conducive to national development, and where landmine and ERW survivors are fully integrated in the society and thus have their rights and needs recognised and fulfilled.”

The obligations of the international donor community and the Government of Afghanistan\textsuperscript{13} in terms of the Anti-Personnel Mine Ban Convention (APMBC) and the Afghan Compact stipulate that:

- By March 2011 area contaminated by mines/ERW will be reduced by 70%
- All stockpiled AP mines will be located and destroyed by end 2007 (achieved)
- By end 2010, all unsafe/unserviceable/ surplus ammunition will be destroyed
- By March 2013 all known mined areas will be cleared

\textsuperscript{13} Afghanistan acceded to the CCM on 8 September 2011. CCM obligation entered into force on 1 March 2012.
Graph 1: % breakdown of casualties against device for 1388 (2010)

Table 1: Landmine and ERW civilian victims by sex, age, device and year (MACCA IMSMA database)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Device</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>AP</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AT</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ERW</td>
<td>519</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>AP</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>492</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AT</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ERW</td>
<td>730</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>AP</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AT</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ERW</td>
<td>505</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>AP</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AT</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>ERW</td>
<td>AP</td>
<td>AT</td>
<td>ERW</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>73</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>336</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>369</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>369</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>356</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>356</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>63</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>356</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>70</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>285</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>160</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>42</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>236</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>234</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>71</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The focus of this survey was the Western Region of Afghanistan, comprising the 4 Provinces of Herat, Fara, Badghis and Ghor. As at 1389 (2010/11), the number of communities in this Region affected by minefields was 133 and battlefields 14. There were 416 minefield hazards and 28 battlefield hazards, covering areas of 86 and 116 sq km respectively.

**A GENDER PERSPECTIVE IN MINE ACTION**

Women, girls, boys and men are affected differently by landmines/ERW and therefore need to be assisted in different ways. Gender influences the exposure to landmines/ERW, the risk of becoming a victim, and the ability to access medical and
psychological services, long term reintegration, MRE and employment.

Due to their gender-specific mobility patterns, roles and responsibilities, women, girls, boys and men often hold different information on areas that are contaminated, or suspected of being contaminated in their communities. If not all groups are consulted in information gathering activities, vital and life-saving information may be lost. In other areas of mine action, such as victim assistance and MRE, gender determines the access to and impact of activities and services, where females often face more restrictions compared to males. Gender specific roles and responsibilities can also mean that women, girls, boys and men have distinct clearance priorities.

A number of guidelines, UN documents and resolutions stress the importance of including gender perspectives and considerations in mine action programmes:

- The UN Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000) on “Women, Peace and Security” specifically emphasises “the need for all parties to ensure that mine clearance and mine awareness programmes take into account the special needs of women and girls”
- Both the Beijing Platform for Action in 1995 and the 1998 Commission on the Status of Women highlighted the special concerns of women in mine affected areas.

**GENDER EQUALITY AS AN END IN ITSELF AND A MEANS TO AN END**

Mine action is an integral part of the wider development/humanitarian sector and therefore contributes to the achievement of United Nations’ Millennium Development Goal 3: “Promote gender equality and empower women”. Mine action organisations are obliged to ensure gender equality and to actively empower women in their activities. Examples of how they can do this are:

- To offer non-traditional employment opportunities for women
- To include female survivors and heads of households affected by landmines/ERW in socio-economic reintegration and inclusion programmes
- To include females in consultations with the communities about mine/ERW contamination and priority-setting for clearance and other mine action activities.

A number of examples from mine affected countries illustrate that mine action activities that do not take gender issues into consideration can exacerbate gender inequalities. For example, if mine action organisations do not consult with women during community meetings, nor include them in surveys, this risks resulting in further marginalisation of these women, as their voices are not heard, and their priorities and needs are not taken into consideration. Likewise, there are examples of gender sensitive mine action that have resulted in the empowerment of women and greater gender equality. Women’s employment opportunities and subsequent empowerment are an end in itself, but also
a means to an end, as female mine action staff members enable organisations to reach out to, and include women in consultations and surveys. The inclusion of representatives of both gender groups in surveys and consultations lead to more complete information on the nature and extent of the problem and a more accurate understanding of all the different priorities and needs in the affected communities. This in turn influences prioritisation processes and the design and implementation of mine action operations, resulting in more sustainable results.

The benefits of gender sensitive mine action are therefore two-fold; it enhances gender equality and the empowerment of women while resulting in more effective and sustainable outcomes and results, which in turn contribute to enhanced security and sustainable and inclusive development for affected women, girls, boys and men.

**GENDER SENSITIVE SURVEYS**

A gender perspective has been mainstreamed throughout the process of this survey. An international gender and mine action specialist was involved in all the phases of the survey - planning, training, implementation and report writing. In order to access both females and males in the affected communities two female survey teams participated in the survey. This enabled the survey to reach out to both female and male community members, and to acknowledge, identify and understand the differences, distinct capabilities, responsibilities, needs and priorities of women, girls, boys and men. All data was collected and analysed in a sex and age disaggregated manner, enabling a thorough gender analysis, identifying gender specific issues and patterns. Key gender considerations during the course of the survey included the following:

- Male surveyors cannot generally access female community members due to cultural restrictions

  *Solution*: Experienced and qualified women were trained to work in all-female survey teams

- Some survey tools were deemed not to be appropriate for women and girls in the affected communities

  *Solution*: Female surveyors played an active role in adapting the tools to the local context

- Cultural restrictions and norms prevent some women from travelling and working away from their family and home area

  *Solutions:*
  1. Women were recruited locally to the extent possible
  2. Women from outside of Herat were accompanied by a Mahram (male family member)
METHODOLOGY AND RESOURCES FOR THE SURVEY

SURVEY APPROACH

The survey used the SL approach\(^\text{14}\) (Figure 1) for the community-level survey and analysis work.

**Figure 1- Sustainable livelihoods framework**

![Sustainable livelihoods framework diagram]

Within this asset-based approach, a number of PRA tools were applied, as follows:

**SURVEY TOOLS**

- Secondary data analysis, particularly the MACCA IMSMA database (Annex Two) and other recent surveys
- A comprehensive introduction to provide information on the team, the objectives of the mission, the potential (realistic) benefits that might come to the community, the methods to be used, people to be involved and time table for the visit
- A “Time-Line” to understand the community’s experiences from the time the area was contaminated with mines/ERW up to the present. Once the time-line has been drawn a number of questions were asked about survivors/victims, MRE and the use and economic value of assets cleared
- “Community Maps” drawn-up with the villagers. Note that these are not classical PRA social maps, but a rapid mapping exercise to show the relationship between the

\(^{14}\)The SL approach fits well with mine action because it is an asset-based approach (and landmines/ ERW block safe access to assets) and it is effective at the community level (thus meshing with Community Impact scoring used in mine action).
village and the contaminated/cleared areas. Once the map was drawn further questions were asked the use and economic value of assets cleared

- Identification of groups of better-off and poor community households for interview using separate focus group discussions, daily clocks and seasonal calendars
- A series of focus group discussions with community leaders, and community members from different age, sex and socio-economic groups
- Daily clocks and seasonal calendars
- Case studies of landmine/ERW survivors and indirect victims
- A photographic and video record of the present situation
- A review by all surveyors to share impressions and conclusions from the visit

Further details of the tools can be found in the training report document (Report on Training on the use of Livelihood Survey Tool, October 2011).

**SELECTION OF COMMUNITIES**

The four communities included in this survey were all in Herat Province. The western AMAC staff shortlisted 11 communities on the basis of security, accessibility, contrast between urban and rural settings, contrast between types of hazard (mines and ERW), and cleared or on-going clearance sites. At the end of the training, these 11 communities were further reduced to four on the basis of current security reports. A clear urban/rural contrast was retained. In addition the three main areas of hazard (around Herat city, along the Herat-Iran road and on the border with Iran) were represented in the sample.

The communities surveyed were: Qala-i-Shater (Injil District) with 300 families (c. 1,800 persons); Jibrael (Centre District) with 800 families (4,800 persons); Qalat-i-Ghazi (Kohsan District) with 100 families (600 persons) and Shakeeban (Zendajan District) with 200 families (1,200 persons). The MACCA database provided details for the 4 chosen communities (Annex 2).

**HUMAN AND MATERIAL RESOURCES**

Figure 2 below shows the organisations involved in the survey. The two international livelihoods and gender specialists were supported by MACCA and DMC in the field. In addition each of the four survey teams included an Afghan social scientist from AIRD (or CSO).

The two women’s teams consisted of an Afghan social scientist and two IP surveyors. The two men’s teams consisted of an Afghan social scientist and four IP/MCPA surveyors including an MCPA staff working in Herat Province.

No specialised equipment was required, each team taking the following to the field: Flip charts, marker pens, notebooks, biro pens, steel ruler, compass, digital camera, video camera with operator (men’s teams), voice recorder (women’s teams). Six vehicles, with
drivers, were required for the field work. *Mahrams* (chaperones) were required for the female staff operating outside their home Province, but these did not travel to the field.

**THE TEAMS**

**Team A (women):** Koochai, Anahita and Shakeeba Rahimi (team leader)

**Team B (women):** Mahbooba, Najeeba and Gulalai Habib (team leader)

Teams A and B were accompanied by Åsa Massleberg (GICHD/GMAP gender specialist) and Malika (translator) on alternate days

**Team C (men):** Niamat Gul, Abdul Qadir, Moh Kabir, Khalil and Moh Rafiq (team leader)

**Team D (men):** Hamid Haidari, Moh Ayaz, Shapur Qayyumi, Ibrahim and Abdul Hadi (team leader)

Teams C and D were accompanied by Barry Pound (GICHD livelihoods specialist) and Aram (translator) on alternate days

In addition DMC staff (Gul Agha Mirzai and Abdul Habib Rahimi) and MACCA staff (Samim Hashimi) accompanied teams in the field.
SURVEY PROCESS

As shown in the visit schedule below, each community was visited by a men’s and women’s team over a two-day period. The community was contacted prior to the team’s arrival, and the visit started with a formal introduction of the team and its objectives, taking care not to raise expectations among community members. The introductions were followed by the Time Line and Community Maps. During these processes, community members identified landmine/ERW survivors and indirect victims who were subsequently interviewed. In addition, the communities identified six poor and six better-off households, and the teams interacted with these socio-economic groups separately using focus group discussion, daily clock and seasonal calendar tools. A photographic record was taken of the village and the survey process. In the men’s teams a commercial video company recorded the survey process, while the women’s discussions were captured on voice recorders.

A review of the survey findings, processes and tools was carried out on the last day of the survey. All materials, carefully labelled, were collected by AITD for translation.

Table 2: Community visit schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Women’s team/days</th>
<th>Men’s team/days</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qala-i-Shater (8km)</td>
<td>Injil</td>
<td>A (Sunday/Monday)</td>
<td>C (Sunday/Monday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jibrael (10km)</td>
<td>Centre</td>
<td>B (Tuesday/Wednesday)</td>
<td>D (Tuesday/Wednesday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi (140km)</td>
<td>Kohsan</td>
<td>B (Sunday/Monday)</td>
<td>D (Sunday/Monday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakeeban (60km)</td>
<td>Zendajan</td>
<td>A (Tuesday/Wednesday)</td>
<td>C (Tuesday/Wednesday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>AMAC</td>
<td>Review of findings, processes and tools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REPORT WRITING
The flip charts and notebook materials were translated by AIRD staff and the soft copy translations and hard copy original field materials were used by the report writing team (Shapur Qayyumi, Qudous Ziaee, Samim Hashimi, Åsa Massleberg and Barry Pound) in Dubai in January 2012 to develop a draft report. A number of discrepancies in the translations meant that there had to be frequent reference to the original field notes so that accuracy was maintained. A stakeholder feedback meeting was held in Kabul in May 2012, during which the recommendations were discussed and some changes suggested. These have been incorporated into the present version of the report.

LIMITATIONS OF THE METHODOLOGY
The information gathered was neither complete nor fully accurate. It depended on: a) the surveyors asking all the questions in their checklists and following up key questions with supplementary “probing” questions (who, what, why, where, when, how?); b) villagers being able to recall information accurately, completely and honestly. A survey of this type is a compromise between speed and accuracy. It provides a reasonably accurate snapshot of reality, but at a fairly coarse resolution. In future surveys with the same calibre of surveyors it would be better to unbundle questions so that they are more distinct and stand less chance of being skimmed over. More specific questions need to be asked of MRE (e.g. did female MRE staff come to your village – when, to whom, how did they interact etc.)

In many cases the responses were not precise or full enough to be able to conduct a
meaningful economic analysis.

It was the intention to use wealth ranking in this survey (it has been used successfully in Bamyan Province), but the Afghan staff with experience in Herat Province felt that its use would be too sensitive (nobody wants to be singled out as rich). Instead we tried to identify a group of better-off people for Focus Group Discussion, as well as a group of less well-off people. This worked to a certain extent, but was not followed through carefully enough.

Video (television quality) was used to record meetings with men, and voice recorders were used for recording the meetings with women. Some good video footage was obtained and the picture quality was excellent. However, the noise interference (many voices at the same time, plus ambient racket) was such that it is difficult to follow the conversations. In future external microphones would improve this situation greatly. The voice recorders did not function adequately.
SURVEY FINDINGS

The findings from the survey are presented below. They represent what communities told us as accurately as possible. The findings are presented under the following section headings:

- Development outcomes and impacts from mine action
- Economic impacts of mine action
- Prioritisation of mine action and the clearance process
- Quality Management
- Mine Risk Education
- Victim assistance
- Capacity Development

Gender and diversity (age, wealth and occupations) are cross cutting issues that have been integrated into the above sections.

Conclusions and recommendations are drawn for each section from what community members told us, and from observation, secondary data and the experience of the team members.

*Surveyors and social scientist interviewing women in the communities*
DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS FROM MINE ACTION

DEVELOPMENT SITUATION OF THE FOUR COMMUNITIES SURVEYED

The four communities were deliberately chosen to represent contrasting urban and rural mine action situations. Two of the communities are close to Herat and can be classified as urban (Qala-i-Shater and Jibrael), while two are rural (Shakeeban and Qalat-i-Ghazi). Each of the communities had its own very distinct character, which is described in the Community Profiles (Annex Three). Some of the key aspects of the four villages are compared in the table below:

Table 3: Characteristics of the four communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Shakeeban</th>
<th>Qalat-i-Ghazi</th>
<th>Jibrael</th>
<th>Qala-i-Shater</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural or urban</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>Urban (but Sha have been walled off and reserved for farming, and 15,000 trees planted)</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main occupation</td>
<td>Farming</td>
<td>Farming and trading</td>
<td>Trade and salaried employment</td>
<td>Salaried employment, commerce and farming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hazards remaining</td>
<td>MF and BF</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>MF</td>
<td>BF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohesive or less cohesive</td>
<td>Cohesive and self-reliant</td>
<td>Fairly cohesive</td>
<td>Cohesive and self-reliant</td>
<td>Less cohesive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private or government land</td>
<td>Some government</td>
<td>Some government</td>
<td>All private</td>
<td>All private</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land disputes</td>
<td>No disputes</td>
<td>No disputes (but Kuchi nomads visit seasonally)</td>
<td>Disputes over ownership of plots</td>
<td>No disputes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influence of powerful landowners</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Insufficient</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Insufficient</td>
<td>Insufficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>Need irrigation water</td>
<td>Need irrigation water</td>
<td>Need drinking water</td>
<td>Need drinking water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinic</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Not easily accessible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The daily clock studies showed strong differences between women’s and men’s daily activities (and roles), big differences in the activities of farmers, CDC officials, teachers, artisans, students and shopkeepers among men - and between housewives and women with other jobs like teaching. Information obtained through the daily clock tool reveals that women’s occupations and socio-economic status impact on their workload, movements outside of their houses, and therefore on their exposure to landmines/ERW. Wealthier women sometimes have the chance of hiring poorer women to assist them with certain chores, while poorer women do not have this option. Seasonal calendars showed that there were marked seasonal differences in activities, mainly related to the farming calendar. Winter is a quiet time with women and men mostly at home, so less exposed to landmine/ERW risk. However some labourers are still expected to work hard in the winter collecting fuel and feeding livestock. Men are more engaged in farming activities than women from spring through to autumn, and also in marketing and purchasing outside the village, involving travel and possible risk from landmines/ERW. Interestingly, respondents in Shakeeban said that if the man is sick or working away from home, the women take on the farm work, demonstrating that there can be some flexibility in gender roles. Risk of injury or death from landmines/ERW is present throughout the year, but greatest in spring and summer.

All land in Qala-i-Shater and Jibrael is privately owned, whereas in the other two communities there is both government and private land (in Shakeeban only where the CDC office is situated). A surprisingly high level of certified land ownership was reported. Only in Jibrael, where many “outsiders” had come to the area subsequent to the start of clearance, were there disputes over land ownership (see the Community profile in Annex Three). This high rate of certification of ownership may contrast with some other parts of Afghanistan (i.e. this aspect of the survey cannot be extrapolated to all parts of the country).

A mixture of crops (wheat, maize, sunflower, saffron, vegetables, sugar beet, beans, chickpea, lentils…), and livestock (cows, sheep, goats, chicken, donkeys, silkworms) are farmed according to prevailing local soil, water, weather, market conditions. Crop yield is very weather dependent, but can be good with the right conditions and inputs. Crops and livestock are interdependent (livestock as a source of fertiliser and draft, crops and crop by-products as a source of livestock feed) and provide food, fibre, animal feed, fertiliser, traction, cash and collateral when needed.

**DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES ARISING FROM MINE ACTION**

Community members told us that landmine/ERW clearance was a pre-requisite for the development of contaminated land. Assets blocked included crop land, grazing land, forest, waterways (including cluster bombs in Qala-i-Shater) and building land. Clearance also provides peace of mind, especially for women (although incomplete clearance such as occurred in Jibrael has prolonged the period of fear that community members, particularly women, feel).
Mine action has also enabled the safe return of refugees and IDPs (through clearance and MRE). For instance, some 80% of the population of Shakeeban fled during the time that the village was on the front line of the civil war. They started to return only after clearance started. Special MRE sessions were held at the Iran/Afghanistan border for returnees.

Land value has increased dramatically after clearance in all communities (see section on Economic returns to demining). Clearance has made many types of development possible as well as providing peace of mind. The value of the land has been further enhanced by the building of houses, mosques, clinics, community centres, shops, schools, business, by the establishment of productive agriculture, and by the installation of facilities such as electricity, water, telephone and roads. Given the very considerable value of land, it is interesting to compare the marginal financial return to capital from traditional food crops and livestock products with other potential land uses (housing, cash crops etc.).

Some locations (Shakeeban and Jibrael) have strong cohesion and a spirit of self-determination and self-reliance due to a fairly homogenous ethnicity. It is suspected that this has led to harmonious development of facilities and activities, in most part financed by the community, in those two communities, whereas we had evidence that other communities (e.g. Qala-i-Shater) had a much greater dependency on outside organisations (e.g. government and agencies such as the World Food Programme) to assist them. In contrast, in Jibrael every family contributed at least USD 30 towards the electricity supply - and the main landowning family of 9 brothers contributed USD 117,000.

Another important development influence is that of large landowners. These were present in all four communities. For example the landowning family of four brothers in Qalat-i-Ghazi owns 900jirib (190ha) of land in Qalat-i-Ghazi and wants to build a sugar beet factory and a dairy in the vicinity (creating >1000 jobs). Already they own a brick factory employing some 150 labourers.

The four communities each have different assets (physical, natural, human, social and economic) that provide opportunities/resources for land and non-land based development - or challenges to such development; e.g. both Shakeeban and Qalat-i-Ghazi have main road access, enabling marketing of produce and access to employment opportunities outside the community; both also have land and river access for productive farming, and electricity that might assist the development of small businesses.

The good schooling facilities (separate boys and girls High Schools on cleared land), the 200 shops and the Disability Centre in Shakeeban point to a bright future for the village.
when combined with its cohesive social network.

With over 600 substantial houses built on cleared land in Jibrael, the sometimes difficult task of clearing mines in a way suitable for infrastructural development has been very worthwhile.

In Qalat-i-Ghazi there are possibilities of major employment opportunities in land-based enterprises enabled due to clearance (dairy and sugar-beet factory).

The future of Qala-i-Shater is less optimistic. The community was severely traumatised by bombardment by Coalition forces in 2002, and has many physical and mental victims from that period (in contrast to the MACCA database which records no fatalities or injuries). Services are poor, especially for a peri-urban situation, and the population seems to have adopted a dependency on external assistance. The present (contaminated) army camp might be converted to an ecological park, but the community might be better off with employment and local schooling and health facilities.

Box 1: Mine action benefits to women and girls in the four communities

- Female respondents in one community pointed out that they “feel safe and secure” – the psychological impact of not worrying as much about accidents was highlighted by most women
- Interviewed women in Qalat-i-Ghazi pointed out that clearance has meant that they can carry out traditional female tasks and responsibilities such as water and firewood collection easily and safely
- A group of interviewed women in Qala-i-Shater highlighted moving around freely and safely, sending their children safely to school, and fetching water safely from the canal as key benefits resulting from clearance. An interviewed mother whose son was killed in a cluster bomb strike in 2001 pointed out that: “now I am very happy and satisfied, because MA teams solved our problems and now we can go everywhere and the children are busy in school. The men go to work.”
- Free movement – “we can go everywhere” - was highlighted by most women as a key benefit stemming from clearance
- Many women pointed out that one key benefit stemming from clearance is that they no longer worry about their children having accidents: “We can move and walk easily and our children can play without fear”
- The safe conduct of agricultural activities was underlined as a key benefit. Corn, lentils, watermelon, wheat are common crops
- A group of girls in Qala-i-Shater pointed out: “we are thanking mine action teams who helped us a lot”
• A group of interviewed girls in Jibrael pointed out that they: “can go to school, play and go to other villages”
• Girls in one community said: “we now feel safe”. They also highlighted that when there had been landmines, they did not feel safe when playing, collecting firewood and fetching water

DEVELOPMENT CHALLENGES AND CONSTRAINTS
Once the threat of mines/ERW is removed, community members are theoretically able to use the assets cleared for productive purposes. However, they are often constrained by lack of cash\(^\text{15}\) (to start, maintain or expand their businesses), poor availability of, or access to, inputs for agriculture or construction, or lack of training in the enterprises that are best suited to the prevailing social and economic conditions. Lack of literacy can be a constraint, as can the lack of linkages to support organisations or lack of political support. In Jibrael, the pace of development is partially determined by the strength of political support for the minority Shia population.

Water for irrigation is a constraint to most rural communities, even when they are close to a major river (which may still run dry in the autumn months), limiting the crops that can be grown and their yield.

Women are severely constrained in their movements and in what they can attend and control. This leads to their having much less (reliable) information than men on which to develop strategies and make decisions. For instance, the interviewed women of Qalat-i-Ghazi were not aware of any development plans for the community. On the other hand they said that they have informed the village leader about their priorities and needs, and that they expect the leader to share their priorities with relevant individuals at the provincial level.

While the provision of schooling for both girls and boys is improving, some cannot attend due to the distance or because they are needed for their labour. Child labour (for shepherding, brick making etc.) is still common, and provides income to poor families but denies the children an education that could have provided a better long-term future for the family.

DEVELOPMENT PRIORITIES OF COMMUNITIES
The table below lists the priorities identified by community women and men during our

\(^{15}\) Formal credit facilities are lacking in most areas, and are only available to those with collateral. Informal loans from shopkeepers or landowners come with a very high interest rate. One possibility is savings and credit groups as promoted by the Aga Khan Foundation and some other NGOs in Afghanistan. These can be non-threatening sources of small loans that are controlled by the savings group members themselves.
discussions with them. In addition, all expressed the wish that clearance should be completed in their communities.

**Table 4: Development priorities as expressed by community women and men**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Qalat-i-Ghazi</strong></td>
<td>Wells and piped water, improved roads, tailoring course, electricity, schools</td>
<td>Safe and sustainable water resources for irrigation Sugar beet plantation (landowner)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Qala-i-Shater</strong></td>
<td>School, public bath, vocational training courses (tailoring and literacy – including for accident victims), clinic, bridge over the canal</td>
<td>Clinic, school, cultural centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shakeeban</strong></td>
<td>Water for irrigation and drinking (sub-surface water is contaminated); flood protection. Survey and clearance of Qroug woodland area</td>
<td>Water for drinking and irrigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jibrael</strong></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Teachers, school, drinking water system, vocational training and bridge to connect two villages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DEVELOPMENT LINKAGES THAT EXIST OR CAN BE SUPPORTED**

Few development organisations, whether government, NGO or private, were operating in the four communities. The demining NGOs were therefore held in great esteem by the communities for being some of the few formal organisations that were making a tangible contribution to their long-term community wellbeing. Some organisations come to the communities and talk to them, but few return and actually do anything useful for the communities.

Women in most communities pointed out that there have been very limited, and in some communities, no external development assistance. Many highlighted the lack of training courses, schools and health care facilities. It is clear that women and girls can easily comprehend the developmental outcomes and impacts stemming from clearance activities. Some interviewed women said that mine action has been the only assistance in their communities, illustrating the concrete and tangible outputs of clearance activities.

The few instances of external assistance that we came across were:

- National Solidarity Programme (NSP). Formation of Community Development Councils and community grants administration in all four communities
• Vaccination campaigns (we saw polio vaccination staff in Jibrael)
• In Qalat-i-Ghazi MRRD built a training hall, and village women received a 3-month tailoring course in 2010
• UN Habitat provided micro-finance and a community fund in Shakeeban
• Disability Centre in Shakeeban, open to all (women, girls and boys and men) with any type of disability (including mental). It opened 16 years ago, funded by UNDP/UNOPS and OCHA. It is now supported by Handicap International (HI). It has its own committee made up of the disabled, the community and the government. It has 4 activities:
  a) Awareness raising of disability and how to minimize it through MRE
  b) Physiotherapy
  c) Inclusion of persons with disabilities into community affairs
  d) Capacity/confidence building for the disabled
The Centre has a 6-month project coordinated by MACCA/DMC, implemented by OMAR and paid for by the Italian government. This mainly centres around vocational training and the provision of materials in: tailoring, carpet making, carpentry and plumbing. The community is very happy with this project which provides skills and income to support the family.

While the above are welcome, a wide range of further development linkages for infrastructural improvement, capacity building and the provision of credit could make a big difference to the communities. As reported under the section on Victim Assistance, there is little formal assistance to victims, apart from the Disability Centre in Shakeeban.

CONCLUSIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)
• Clearance enables a wide range of land and non-land activities/employment, encourages investment, reduces fear and enables the return of refugees/IDPs
• Mine action enables better education (building of schools, safer access to schools for children and teachers)
• Mine action enables better health (reduced death and injury; building of clinics and safe access for staff; rehabilitation of water sources)
• Clearance creates opportunities for large scale enterprises (e.g. sugar beet, dairy, brick-making in Qalat-i-Ghazi)
• Homogeneous communities seem most self-reliant and development oriented (community contributions – e.g. Jibrael). Combined with strong, benign leadership from wealthy landowners this can result in accelerated development following the removal of hazards
• The economic value of assets increases dramatically following clearance. As asset values change, there is a need to re-assess crop/livestock returns as a function of land values to see if they are still the most viable option
• Communities and individuals (including victims) need capital/credit to start or expand their businesses
• They also need vocational and literacy training and training facilities
Daily and seasonal activities vary hugely by gender, age, occupation and wealth, and there are marked gender roles and responsibilities (but these can be flexible according to circumstance)

Some aid dependence was noted in one community (Qala-i-Shater)

Few development agencies (government, NGO or private) are active and effective in rural areas

RECOMMENDATIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)

MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints

The Unit should also conduct economic analysis of development options so as to be able to give appropriate advice to agencies

The Unit should consider the considerable diversity within and between communities (gender, age, wealth, ethnicity, environmental, political...), and adapt tools and activities accordingly

Mine action and development should be linked through the coordination of communication, monitoring, research and development initiatives between focal points in a network of relevant development agencies (government, NGO, private, donor) by the MAPA Liaison Officer

An initial step in developing this coordinated network could be the training of the 22 existing focal points and other key people in a workshop designed to ensure the focal persons understand the relationships between mine action activities and improved livelihoods for community members

Information related to development needs and priorities should be shared with development organizations to strengthen the link between mine action and development

In order to maximize the developmental benefits for women, ensure their development priorities are taken into account in information gathering prioritization processes and in post clearance activities, and that all information is disaggregated by sex and age

The video materials obtained during the survey should be reviewed (perhaps together with still photographs taken during the two L&L surveys) to make a short film that illustrates: a) the tools used in the survey; b) the impact of mine action on rural and urban communities. The film can be used for training and for advocacy.

16 Cartagena Action Plan Action # 25: Collect and analyse all necessary data in a sex and age disaggregated manner
**ECONOMIC RETURNS TO INVESTMENT IN MINE ACTION**

As was the case with the initial L&L survey in Afghanistan, the survey teams collected insufficient quantitative data to allow a proper economic analysis of the mine action activities in these four communities. What raw data were collected are summarised in Annex Four. Still, some partial analysis can be done, which provides some insight into the magnitude of benefits and complements the qualitative data obtained through the other survey tools.

The first point to make is that the scale of contamination and demining differed markedly across the communities.
According to MACCA’s standard cost estimates for demining, almost USD 5.8 million has been invested in demining of these four communities to date, and another USD 4.6 million will be required to remove the contamination entirely. However, the size of the hazard in two of the villages is huge, and atypical for contaminated villages in Afghanistan. The cost of clearance of an “average community” is of the order of USD150-200,000.

LAND VALUES

The simplest way to assess the purely economic benefits is by collecting data on land values. The market value of a piece of land should approximate the expected value of discounted economic benefits flowing from that land in the future. People in all the communities mentioned – unsurprisingly – that land values increased substantially after demining, but the survey teams collected clear figures from men in only two communities, and from women in a third.

---

17 MACCA estimates minefield clearance costs USD1.25/sq. m., while sub-surface battle area clearance (BAC) costs USD0.41/sq. m.

18 ‘Discounted’ means converting future economic benefits into ‘present value’ terms to reflect people’s time preference for money (i.e. most people would choose to take USD100 today rather than USD100 a year from now). Land values may, however, be higher when there are few safe alternative investments (land as a ‘store of value’) and be lower when, for example, land rights are not deemed to be secure because of conflict or corruption. All these factors are at play in Afghanistan.
Table 5: Demining costs and the value of land

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Demining cost (USD 000s)</th>
<th>Sale value of land (USD 000s)</th>
<th>Value as % cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakeeban (M)</td>
<td>USD202</td>
<td>USD165</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi (M)</td>
<td>USD2,514</td>
<td>USD6,157</td>
<td>USD7,183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qala-i-Shater (W)</td>
<td>USD188</td>
<td>USD3,926</td>
<td>2086%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(M) = men (W) = women

The land value figures obtained from women in Qala-i-Shater appear to be extraordinarily high (equivalent to USD 25/sq.m.) and seven times higher than those provided by men in Qalat-i-Ghazi. However, Qala-i-Shater is peri-urban and both Shakeeban and Qalat-i-Ghazi are rural. As well, the value of houses given by the men in Qala-i-Shater were four to five times higher than quoted by men in Qalat-i-Ghazi, so one would expect land to be worth substantially more as well.

Regardless, focusing only on the two rural communities, and assuming that contaminated land is worth little or nothing, demining appears to have been a very good investment. The increase in land value alone is equivalent to 82% of demining costs in Shakeeban, and between 245% and 286% in Qalat-i-Ghazi. Indeed, with these assumptions, the economic benefits accruing from demining in Qalat-i-Ghazi exceed the cost of demining done to date in all four communities.

OTHER ECONOMIC BENEFITS

Community residents provided a good deal of additional evidence on economic benefits, but these are either extremely modest (crop agriculture and livestock) or the data do not allow an estimate of how much of the benefit could be attributed to demining.

For example, residents of all four communities said the significant numbers of houses had been constructed, but it is unclear whether all of these were constructed on the land that had been demined. For example, the men in Qalat-i-Ghazi said 30 houses had been constructed in the village and 600 more in the wider area affected by the hazard. It is very possible that some of those would have been constructed regardless of the demining (i.e., they are outside the contaminated areas).

As well, it would be necessary to understand whether viable alternatives existed for

---

19 For example, from the sparse data collected, net income from crops and livestock appear to be from USD26-USD200/jirib in rural Qalat-i-Ghazi and USD310-USD1,065/jirib in peri-urban Qala-i-Shater. Only the highest of these (USD1,065/jirib) would yield an internal rate of return (IRR) approaching 10% -- the typical cut-off used to assess whether an investment is worthwhile in economic terms.
economic activities (i.e. could residents have built their houses on uncontaminated land?) to quantify the benefits stemming from demining. If good alternatives existed, benefits would be limited to the incremental convenience of building on demined land.

Still, the general descriptions suggest the demining contributed to some very significant benefits and enabled follow-on investments. For example:

- in Jibrael, a school, clinic, mosque, electricity supply and water channel, as well as about 600 residences, have already been built on the cleared land
- in Qalat-i-Ghazi, a prosperous family has constructed a brick factory (employing 150 people) and has plans to invest in a sugar beet plantation and factory (which could employ 1,000) and a dairy
- in Shakeeban, a school and a clinic have been built on demined land

VALUING SECURITY
It seems clear from the respondents (particularly the women) that a sense of security is a highly – and perhaps the highest – valued benefit. This is reflected both in the responses themselves and in the fact that demining was followed by inflows of people. For example, respondents in Shakeeban said 80 per cent of the population fled during the conflicts close to their community, but returned when demining started. Thousands of Hazara settled the former minefields in Jibrael, in which 600 homes have been built.

COST OF SURVEY
This survey cost approximately USD 85,000 plus the time of MACCA personnel and the survey teams, giving a total cost of perhaps USD 100,000. While not insignificant, the estimated cost of demining in the four communities is about USD 5.8 million, and another USD 4.5 million of demining will need to be done before all the contamination has been cleared. Thus, the survey represents approximately 1.7 per cent of the demining costs to date, and less than 1 per cent of the ultimate demining costs. This is an acceptable expenditure, in particular because:

- the survey informs the entire MAPA – a programme with a budget in the range of USD 100 million per year
- about one-third of the project cost was for capacity development rather than the survey itself
- about 50 per cent of the total project cost was for fees and airfares for international personnel, who would not be required to plan and implement a future survey following the same design.

CONCLUSIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
Although the amount of quantitative data collected by the survey teams was insufficient in most cases, the land value data suggests that demining in these four communities has been, on balance, a sound investment in economic terms.
RECOMMENDATIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
- the MACCA and the GICHD should investigate secondary sources for (i) farming systems studies and (ii) land values
- the MACCA and the GICHD should conduct a second workshop on ‘good enough’ economic analysis of demining projects\(^\text{20}\) for social scientists from AIRD, and for senior personnel in the MACCA and the MAPA partners who are responsible for socio-economic surveys or heavily involved in planning and prioritisation
- the MACCA and the MAPA partners should re-assess their survey forms for quantitative socio-economic data, modify it if necessary based on the outcomes of the economic analysis workshop, and re-train survey teams to ensure they can bring back adequate quantitative data for analysis.

PRIORITISATION OF MINE ACTION
Two of the four main objectives of the mine action and livelihoods survey were: 1) to find out whether the prioritization process of MAPA is working well, and how it can be further improved, and 2) directing the focus of QM to the outcome level of the cleared areas.

The focus group discussion tool provided the most useful information from different groups of women, girls, boys and men on the mine action processes, the inclusion of communities in priority setting and the satisfaction of community members with the conduct and outcome of hazard clearance.

PRESENT PRIORITY SETTING PROCESSES IN MAPA
The nature and extent of the landmine/ERW problem in Afghanistan results in many assistance requests being received from individuals, communities and organizations (government, UN and NGOs), but since the resources are limited, a process of prioritization is applied. Socio-economic impact and community benefit are the primary principles upon which the priority system is based. These could be where several civilian landmine/ERW casualties are occurring for the population in a specific village, supporting rehabilitation or repatriation of refugees or IDP. In general, the number of people to benefit from the mine action work and the immediacy of that benefit are guiding factors when determining mine action priorities.

The MACCA process of priority setting is based on the available information recorded in IMSMA data base. The information from the data base is used to compile a ranking of communities according to the severity of mine impact. The criteria for assessing impact are chosen to reflect the risks and the extent and value of blocked assets, the types of areas to which landmines/ERW are blocking access, including services and livelihoods, the number of recent victims and the nature of the contamination and the terrain. High-

\(^{20}\) A preliminary workshop was held in March 2011 following the stakeholders workshop for the initial L&L Survey.
impact communities are given priority attention for clearance and MRE.

Since 2009 the following criteria have been used for grading the contaminated areas as low, medium and high impacted areas:

1. Known victims linked to hazards
2. Local authority/villagers requests
3. Resettlement/Development areas
4. Blockages, such as (1) Agriculture fields (2) Non-agriculture fields (3) Water access (4) Other Infrastructure (5) Critical Infrastructure –this relates to infrastructure such as schools, health clinics and mosques
5. No. of affected families as a result of contamination
6. Small Hazardous areas
7. Hazardous areas located close to centre of the community which cause psychological stress to people
8. Anti-personnel minefields on flat land affecting high number of people
9. Device type: Mine/ERW

In addition, taking into consideration the Victim Prediction Model (VPM) developed by the Survey Action Centre\textsuperscript{21}, two additional factors were considered:

- Size of the community
- Size of the hazardous area

**PERCEPTION OF PRIORITY SETTING BY SURVEYED COMMUNITIES**

The survey indicates that the communities are satisfied with the priority setting process used by MAPA for planning the clearance of hazardous areas.

- Separate focus group discussion with women, girls, boys and men were conducted, and during each focus group discussion it was found that the people were directly or indirectly involved on providing recommendation to the demining team about which areas need urgent clearance
- It was interesting that in one community the women stated that they provided their recommendation about which areas have to be cleared first to the MRE teams working with women. It is not known whether these recommendations reached the de-mining team
- Women generally expressed that clearance had been done in the “right areas” - “every time we request something, clearance has happened”
- When asked about prioritization in Shakeeban community, the female respondents pointed out that the clearance of a road resulted in a previously non-accessible area becoming accessible

\textsuperscript{21} The rationale for considering these additional factors is discussed in detail in the VPM document, available via the Survey Action Centre’s website: \url{www.sac-na.org}
Female respondents in Jibrael highlighted that men in their communities had requested MA organisations to come to their areas to carry out clearance, and that MA staff listened to the advice and opinions from (male) villagers. Likewise, interviewed women in Qalat-i-Ghazi pointed out that elders in their community had visited MA organizations and asked them to come to their community and clear the landmines.

Female respondents in Qala-i-Shater pointed out that MA organisations interacted with men in their community before clearance started, and that residential areas and the canal were prioritized for clearance.

Interviewed women in Shakeeban pointed out that the following areas had been prioritized for clearance: Agricultural land, pasture land, residential areas, roads and land surrounding electrical infrastructure. They also pointed out that clearance of the above areas has brought benefits for the people and resulted in “very good facilities for poor people.”

When a group of boys were asked about their clearance priorities, they indicated: “since those who are collecting fire wood or tending animal are mostly at risk of mines and ERW; therefore, the grazing areas should have priority for clearance”. These boys participated in the survey in Qala-i-Shater village where five mine victims were involved in collecting fire wood and grazing the animals at the time of their accidents.

According to the people of Qala-i-Shater, the dropping of cluster bombs by US forces during 2002 resulted in 12 deaths (including one woman) and 18 serious injuries in one month. The area was prioritized as high priority for clearance. After it was cleared the people feel safe and are no longer concerned about cluster munitions in their village.

The poor group of men in Qala-i-Shater village expressed their satisfaction of the demining process, saying: “We are happy with mine action organisations, they do not discriminate between the poor and the rich and are consulting poor people for planning the clearance of contaminated areas”.

In another example in Qalat-i-Ghazi village in Kohsan district the local men are expecting mine action organisations to finish all the remaining contaminated areas located in their community. “We were consulted about which areas should be cleared first, and the demining teams carried out their work according to our advice; we also ask mine action organisations to give priority to the rest of the contaminated area in our community, because we are afraid of the lands around the village which are still contaminated by mine and ERW”.

In the same village, the women said: “We are afraid of lands around the village which are still contaminated by mine and ERW. Livestock, men and boys are at risk of mines, so the area where they need to go has to be cleared”.

CONCLUSIONS (PRIORITISATION)
Although the results from only four communities out of a total of 2115 impacted communities in Afghanistan could not provide a full understanding of people’s
perception on priority setting process of MAPA, they indicate that the people have no complaints and are happy with the process. The findings of the survey encourage MACCA and the DMC to retain the criteria used for selection of the areas for clearance; however the recommendations below will further improve the process:

RECOMMENDATIONS (PRIORITISATION)

- MAPA should give similar priority to mental trauma caused by accidents as to physical injury (the bombardment of Qala-i-Shater provides a good example of long-term mental trauma)
- The suggestions made by local people on accelerating the process of clearing the remaining contaminated areas within their communities should be gathered and acted upon where appropriate
- There should be an annual review of local clearance priorities through liaison with the communities; thus, MACCA can ensure community involvement and can have a better understanding of the on-going needs of the communities affected by mines/ERW.
- Demining organizations should consult with communities as part of the process of selection of the next areas for clearance, and should be aware of village development plans (e.g. planned location of new schools etc.)
- Since women, girls, boys and men (and also poorer and better off people) within a community have different exposure to hazards; separate meetings should be conducted with different groups in order to make sure their needs are addressed
- All information should be collected and analysed in a sex and age disaggregated manner, in order to take into account the different priorities of all age and sex groups
- Female MA staff members should be deployed when collecting prioritization-related information from affected communities, facilitating the access to female community members
- Women should be ensured meaningful participation at priority-setting meetings and their views should be taken into account and reflected in the final ranking of priorities
- Considering the daily and seasonal activities of female and male community members will help understand when is a good time to arrange meetings to find out about their clearance priorities
- Analyzing the past recorded civilian accidents will help to find out in which season of the year the people mostly become landmine victims. The findings can be fed into clearance operations and MRE messages.

SHARING AND RECEIVING MINE ACTION INFORMATION WITH WOMEN

There appears to be a specific problem in sharing and receiving of information with community women because of their lack of mobility and the mostly male make-up of mine action staff. Women often receive information second-hand by various routes. This information may not be accurate or well explained, and can be taken out of
context. Women obtain information through secondary sources; there were no instances of mine action organizations sharing clearance related information directly with women. The last bullet point in the Box below shows the dangers of not communicating directly with women.

**Box 2: Mine action information pathways for community women**

- A group of interviewed women in Shakeeban pointed out that they received information about landmines from “NGOs” (not clear if these are MA organizations, or other NGOs)
- Post-clearance information was shared by elders, who informed women they could use schools and clinics
- Interviewed women in Shakeeban informed us that they received information from elders after clearance had been completed. They further pointed out that the elders in their community informed them that they should not go to one area (Quroq) since this particular area was still contaminated by landmines
- Interviewed women in Qala-i-Shater informed us that “their men” received post-clearance information from council members, and that men were informed at the Mosque through the Mullah
- Teachers, parents and government people shared information to girls about clearance and risks
- Girls in Qala-i-Shater informed us that brothers and fathers had informed them that there used to be many landmines, but that mine action teams came and cleared them
- Many women pointed out that they received information related to MA (such as the start and completion of clearance activities) from their husbands. This was the case in Qalat-i-Ghazi for example, where the female respondents said their husbands told them about clearance activities
- A group of eight female teachers in Jibrael community informed us that about 15-20 persons had been killed or injured in landmine accidents after the completion of the first clearance. The women pointed out that these accidents happened in cleared land that had been thought to be safe, and resulted in them questioning how safe cleared land really was, and they started worrying more about accidents. These accidents also resulted in these women losing confidence and trust in MA organisations: “We don’t trust the MA organizations.” The women were under the impression that AMAC had not carried out any post-accident investigations. Male respondents from the same community however, informed us that investigations had been carried out, and that a second additional clearance had been carried out in the area where the accidents had taken place. For some reason this important information had not been shared with the female respondents
- The level of awareness of mine action related issues amongst female respondents varied between the four surveyed communities. The eight female teachers of Jibrael
community displayed a high level of awareness in some areas, informing the survey team of the type of contamination, which organizations had been involved in clearance, etc. In contrast, one group of female respondents in Shakeeban community had quite limited knowledge of some issues, and referred to their husbands on many occasions. This variation in the level of awareness could be explained by their level of education, and their occupation.

**RECOMMENDATIONS (INFORMATION SHARING)**

- Improve access to women through the deployment of female mine action staff members
- Ensure women receive first-hand information, through female mine action staff reaching out to women and sharing information directly
- Ensure women are included in handover procedures, and that they receive first-hand information related to which areas have been cleared, and which are safe to use\(^22\)
- Monitor information sharing with women and men post clearance through post clearance sex disaggregated community data

\(^{22}\) Cartagena Action Plan, Action Point # 15: *Involve women and men in handover*
• Organize meetings with community women, utilizing local structures like women’s Shura. This can be an effective way of reaching out to, and including women, taking into consideration their needs, priorities and capabilities

• Ensure information sharing is age and gender sensitive, taking into consideration the level of education and illiteracy issues

QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Conducting safe and well-managed demining operations is essential to making sure that the quality of demining operations is good, and that the contaminated areas are cleared to the approved standard.

The MACCA QM system starts with the accreditation process and ends after post-clearance inspection. It provides MACCA with confidence that the land which was cleared is safe for its intended use.

The MACCA QA process focuses on the capability of mine action organizations; i.e. their human resources, equipment and procedures, and considers how this capability is being applied in the field. External monitoring complements an internal monitoring system and verifies that the QA procedures and QC inspections of all mine action organizations working in Afghanistan are appropriate and being applied effectively.

Well managed demining operations involve proper assessment of the area in order to find all the necessary information related to the type of mine/ERW, type of land, methodology and assets to be used for clearance. If the quality of the initial assessment and survey is not good, it will lead to serious negative consequences.

SURVEY FINDINGS ON QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Out of the four communities visited during the survey, in three communities no one talked of any accidents within the cleared area after it was handed over for community use, and also no one indicated that they found any mine or ERW after the clearance was completed. Generally in all four visited communities it was found that the community members are confident that the area is safe after it was cleared by demining teams.

However, in one community the people were justifiably dis-satisfied with the quality of demining operations previously conducted by mine action organisations for clearance of contaminated areas within their community. This was in the Jibrael community where a vast anti-tank mine contaminated area was cleared during 1996 -2006 by one of the demining organizations using dogs. After it was handed over to the community, the people decided to make it a residential area. Around ten accidents happened, which caused people to stop working and resulted in death and injuries to 24 persons, and the destruction of eight vehicles. The investigation of the accidents after the clearance revealed that the main cause of the accidents was that flooding and wind had resulted in earth covering the mines to a depth that was undetectable by the dogs, especially in the prevailing high winds. When digging foundations or using heavy vehicles, the mines...
were triggered. The weak assessment and management of the clearance operations caused people to be suspicious of the entire area that had been previously cleared, causing it to be completely re-cleared, which was costly and time-consuming. According to the focus group discussion, men stated that: “After the accidents happened in cleared areas, we lost our trust in mine action; however, we requested the mine action to re-survey and clear the whole area”. Consequently, re-clearance was approved in 2009 after a proper survey was conducted. The re-clearance (by HALO Trust) is still on-going. However, the survey indicated that in most parts of the area modern houses have been built and it is not possible to conduct full clearance operations unless the houses are destroyed. In those areas where demining is possible, the survey recommended use of mechanical equipment in combination with manual methods.

The women in Qala-i-Shater were still unsure about clearance of a canal where there is the possibility of air-dropped cluster-bomb contamination remaining. Women in Shakeeban also told the survey team that they are very suspicious of an area called Qroug outside the village where they go to collect firewood. They would be much happier if that area could be surveyed and cleared if necessary.

As in the landmines & livelihoods survey of 2010 in the central and northern regions of Afghanistan, this survey also indicates that there is no quality management focus on the outcomes or impact of mine action activities. For instance, in all of the communities it was found through focus group discussions and case studies that the mine/ERW victims did not receive sufficient victim assistance; different groups of mine victims (women, girls, boys and men) stated that no one is following-up on this issue.

Although some post-demining impact assessment (PDIA) had been conducted by MACCA in the past for some of the cleared mined areas, none of the communities stated that during or after clearance anyone came to ask them how confident they are in the safety of the cleared area and whether they are using the cleared assets safely and productively without interference from powerful influences.

Interviewed women in two surveyed communities pointed out that the “MA process was good, clear, transparent”, and that it was “equal for all.” In three out of four communities, the general feedback on the MA process and MA personnel’s interaction with the affected community members was very positive.
The HALO Trust camp at Jibrael

CONCLUSIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)
MACCA has been successful with the QA and QC of the outputs of demining operations. Where there have been quality problems in the de-mining operation, these have been investigated and rectified. However, the lessons learned from these investigations and records of QA and QC have not been properly tracked for avoiding further undesired events.

In Jibrael there were mine accidents following supposed clearance. However, this was due to exceptional circumstances (deeply buried mines [by wind-blown soils and flood sediments] and the construction of buildings requiring deep foundations and heavy machinery). In correct fashion, an enquiry was held and a second clearance is underway which has found only one mine.

RECOMMENDATIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)

• Establish a strong quality management process that focuses not only on the quality of the actual clearance operations, but also ensures that clearance is “fit for purpose” – i.e. it takes into account the intended use of the cleared land.
• Continue strengthening processes (e.g. livelihoods and PDIA surveys and the use of the Balanced Scorecard approach) that assess post-handover outcomes, impacts and opportunities
• Add a strong, clear and routine community liaison process to the QA process of MACCA QM to ensure involvement of female and male community members in mine action planning, implementation and outcome assessment
• Include QA of victim assistance activities in MACCA QM as these are poor at present.
MINE RISK EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

The End Goal of the Government of Afghanistan for MRE will be achieved when a comprehensive and sustainable system is in place to educate and raise awareness to people and communities nationwide regarding the residual mine/ERW threats, including sufficient information to recognise and report these items to the appropriate authorities.

MRE refers to the educational activities which seek to reduce the risk of injury from mines and ERW by raising awareness and promoting behavioural changes amongst ‘at risk’ groups. MRE should ensure that women, girls, boys and men in the affected communities are aware of the risks from mines and ERW and are encouraged to behave in a way which reduces the risk to people, property, and the environment. The objective is to reduce the risk to a level where people can live safely, and to re-create an environment where economic and social development can occur free from the constraints imposed by contamination.

The MACCA/MAPA MRE operations within Afghanistan are based on:

- An operational principle of understanding the landmine/ERW threats to communities and individuals
- Identifying vulnerable or target groups
- Providing appropriate and targeted messages, and
- Confirming new knowledge used in MACCA/MAPA annual planning and priority settings.

The MRE programme is currently comprised of the following MAPA MRE implementing partners:

- OMAR
- HI
- ARCS
- Association for Aid and Relief (AAR Japan)
- Mobile Mini Circus for Children (MMCC)
- DDG

SURVEY FINDINGS ON MRE

The survey included questions about when MRE was carried out, by who, where and what should be done if any suspicious device of any kind is found. The knowledge of mines and ERW and their location, the significance of different colours and the status of the demining activities varied between villages, but also between women, girls, boys and men. The findings are first presented by community.

Shakeeban community, Zendajan District, Herat Province

MRE activities started in this community during 1992 according to the elders’ group,
while the women’s group mentioned that the MRE programme was started in 2005. This indicates that women in this community might have less information about MRE activities than men.

Shakila, a 16 years old girl victim mentioned that she didn’t receive any MRE before her accident took place. She was injured in 2001 while she was playing with her sister and found an ERW. The ERW exploded and her shoulder was injured. She is currently in class 7 in a private school in Shakeeban. In contrast Wakil, another of the mine victims, mentioned that he was conducting MRE for school children and he was trained by OMAR as a community volunteer for MRE.

The majority of girls and boys in Shakeeban have received MRE, and they mentioned that mines and ERW are dangerous and can be found in un-cleared areas. They say they will report to the demining teams if they come across mines or ERW. They also stated that they will not touch any suspicious objects, and they mentioned that they can move to their school and around the village without fear. Some boys mentioned that Quroq area is still contaminated according to advice from adults, and they avoid going there.

Women were aware of mine and ERW threats, and mentioned that they have received MRE through NGOs and have shared their messages with their children. They highlighted that they have participated in mine action activities and they helped the MRE teams in terms of gathering the children and providing a place for MRE sessions. The women also mentioned that Quroq is an area that is still contaminated and suggested that mine action teams should check the area. They said that all mine action activities, including MRE, have been coordinated with community people from start to finish.

Qala-i-Shater community, Injil District, Herat Province

MRE activities were started in this community in 2001 by OMAR.

A group of girls mentioned that they know mines and ERW are dangerous items and they will not touch them as advised by their parents and brothers. Even a pen, eraser or pot could be dangerous according to this group. They mentioned that they have received MRE through school teachers, their parents and some NGOs/government people in the mosques in their village.

The women said that they received MRE through their elders when they returned to their village from Iran, but they couldn’t attend the MRE sessions directly. Women’s challenges to access and attend MRE sessions are mainly due to cultural norms and values that restrict women’s movements and participation in activities outside of their households.
The boys said that they received MRE several times from their parents, NGOs and school teachers. They added that mines are dangerous, and can kill them if they touch them. They said that if they saw a mine they would report it to the police. They also mentioned that they will avoid going to places contaminated by mines and ERW.

**Jibrael community, Centre District, Herat Province**

The MRE activities started in Jibrael in 2003 according to the women’s group, while the group of men mentioned that MRE was conducted in 2009/2010.

Interviewed girls in Jibrael pointed out that they: “got information through school and posters. Were told that if we see mines, we should not touch and quickly inform elders”

Many women pointed out they received MRE-related information from village elders and also at the Iranian border when returning to Afghanistan after the war. These women further pointed out that male and female MRE trainers had visited Jibrael, delivering MRE.

During a focus group discussion boys mentioned that they have received information through MRE and that they will not touch mines and ERW for any reason as it will kill them. They mentioned that they saw a person killed by a mine, but now they are feeling safe as there are no more mines in their village.

**Qalat-i-Ghazi community, Kohsan District, Herat Province**

According to the timelines, the MRE programme was started in this community during 2003. The community elders mentioned that there have been huge numbers of people killed and injured in their community by mines and ERW. They have also lost much of their livestock because of mines and ERW in the past. Sultan, a mine survivor, said that he attended MRE sessions and found them useful.

A group of women mentioned that the MRE teams came to their village several times. “We didn’t know even about MRE and mine action before 2002”. They said that they attended MRE workshops 3 – 4 times in their village. The last time was in 2010. The women had taken part directly, and they found them very good. They mentioned when they received MRE they shared the information with their children which was helpful. They said that they are satisfied with the MRE activities in their village.

A second group of women mentioned that they received MRE through teachers and that the teachers also trained children. They were asked if they know where the mines are. They said that they know mines might be around the community, but they don’t know the exact place.

A group of children in this community mentioned that they attended MRE courses conducted in the village. The course used pictures, which they put in their houses for
the benefit of other family members. They said that they will not touch mines and ERW and will not enter ruined houses. “If we see white signs in the agricultural lands then we know it means that there no mines and it is safe”.

SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS ON MRE FROM WOMEN

The information collected by women surveyors was compromised by the lack of knowledge amongst community women about events outside their immediate homestead and family, and the difficulties they face in getting information directly and not just through their male relatives or children. This varies from one community to another.

There are also differences between the information collected from men and from women as well as from boys and girls, even for factual information (e.g. dates of MRE activities, MRE implementers, recent victims and numbers of victim etc.). Some of this is due to inaccuracy of recall, and some due to a lack of knowledge or reference leading to guesstimates being provided to the survey teams.

The level of MRE coverage for women appears to vary between villages and between age groups, with younger women more likely to have received MRE. The need for MRE remains acute and the general ability of women to recall MRE messages was mixed. Some women were adequately informed about mine risks and were able to provide details on the location of mines and knew of the warning signs, whereas others were unsure of the location of minefields.

In Shakeeban and Jibrael villages, there was evidence of successful MRE aimed at school children, covering younger girls and boys (between 8 – 13 years old) and teenagers. Several girls in these communities were able to give examples of protective behavior such as avoiding contaminated sites and knowing who to inform when ERW or mines are discovered.

As well as information being received directly from agencies visiting villages, women in one community also mentioned that they receive information from other women (teachers) and from male members of the household. In the community of Shakeeban most of the women were returnees, mainly from Iran. Some of them recalled being provided with MRE by UNHCR when they crossed the border into Afghanistan.

While it is clear that MRE teams have visited all surveyed communities, it appears that only in one community (Jibrael) have female MRE teams reached out to women.

MRE PATHWAYS

The messages promoted by MRE teams reach community members by different routes. Those found in the communities include:

- Teachers received MRE, then taught the children in schools
Many women pointed out they received information from village elders
Women also learned from other women who were teachers
In one community, women highlighted they received information from elders when returning to the area
Boys said: “We got information through school and posters. We were told that if we see mines, we should not touch and quickly inform elders”
MRE volunteers were trained by OMAR
Children received warnings from parents about what to do and about locations that are still dangerous
Returnees from Iran were given MRE classes by UNHCR at the border

*Girls receive MRE from school teachers, parents and elders*
Table 6: MRE situation in the surveyed communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Boys</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>Women know about mines and ERW threats, but access to women in this community still seems to be difficult compared to boys and girls.</td>
<td>Girls know about the danger of mines and ERW, but still there were some girls that didn’t receive any MRE as they were refugees in Iran.</td>
<td>Men were mostly aware of the threats posed by landmines and ERW in this village.</td>
<td>More boys aware of the risks and risky behaviour in this village; in particular boys aged 8 – 15 years old mostly received MRE through school teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>Women in this community mostly received MRE through community elders (men). Women couldn’t attend MRE sessions and access to women needs to be improved.</td>
<td>More girls were informed of safe behaviour and who to report the dangerous items.</td>
<td>Men have been informed who to report and where the dangerous objects can be found.</td>
<td>Boys (mostly teenagers) have been aware of risky behaviours and have mostly received MRE through their parents, NGOs and school teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>Close to city. Women know about MRE</td>
<td>Most of the village people have been aware of mine/ERW threats, in particular school girls.</td>
<td>No data available for men.......</td>
<td>Boys in this village seemed to be more aware of risky behaviours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi</td>
<td>More women aware of threats of mines and ERW. They also and shared MRE messages with their children based on their statements.</td>
<td>Girls have been informed of dangerous areas and risky behaviours</td>
<td>Older men shared information with the women.</td>
<td>MRE was more useful for boys in this village based on their knowledge. Boys shared MRE messages and leaflets with their family members and know about danger signs and avoiding entering destroyed and abandoned houses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table below shows the number of people who have received MRE through MAPA assets in the surveyed communities according to the MACCA database – Ministry of Education data is not included here:

Table 7: Number of people who have received MRE according to the MACCA database from the beginning of mine action activities in these communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Province</th>
<th>District</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Number of people who have received MRE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Injil</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>4,038</td>
<td>6,307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Kohsan</td>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Zendajan</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSIONS (MRE)
- All villages received some MRE (men, girls and boys more than the women).
- Coverage is not complete. Not all children attend school and many women have restricted mobility
- There is no evidence of female MRE staff interacting with female community members in three of the four communities

RECOMMENDATIONS (MRE)
- Recognise and take into consideration MRE accessibility challenges for women and girls when planning MRE visits
- Ensure MRE activities take into account the particular exposure of boys and men, and that activities at the time of accident are recorded when collecting accident data, in order to enable the tailoring and targeting of MRE to gender related exposure and behavior
- Consider and use the KAPB-related information on women and girls, and make sure MRE activities are tailored and designed on the basis of this information, taking into consideration female-specific roles and responsibilities that result in exposure to landmines/ERW
- Design and implement MRE activities, recognizing the seasonal variations in all community members’ gender specific roles and responsibilities
- Conduct MRE follow-up sessions, in particular in Qalat-i-Ghazi and Qala-i-Shater focusing on risky behaviour
- Ministry of Education should take more responsibilities in areas where the MAPA MRE resources are not available.

23 Cartagena Action Plan Action # 52: … assistance should be based on appropriate surveys, needs analysis, age-appropriate and gender sensitive strategies
• Further develop the MRE multi-media campaign to reach more people through different channels
• Deploy all-female MRE teams in order to ensure female community members are directly included in MRE activities
• Identify and train female MRE volunteers wherever possible and teachers in affected communities within government networks (NSP, local network and MoPH health workers)
• Ensure that MRE is communicated through gender and age sensitive channels, and that challenges like illiteracy, which is highly gendered, is taken into consideration when designing MRE materials
• Include more specific questions on MRE when designing future surveys. The survey teams must understand the questions and must provide a full set of data to facilitate the report writing.

This canal in Qala-i-Shater may still contain cluster bombs. Children are taught to report anything suspicious to mine action staff, police or elders
VICTIM ASSISTANCE (“DISABLED IS NOT UNABLE”)

INTRODUCTION
Three decades of war in Afghanistan destroyed the economic and social basis of the Afghan society. The mines and ERW left by the war have killed and injured many people. The victims are not only those who died or suffered physical injury, but also those who have suffered loss of a family member or of livestock, equipment or property. The victims also include those who have dedicated all or part of their lives to caring for an injured relative. A further category of victim that is given very little attention is the mentally traumatised.

All categories need moral, medical and financial support to enable them to live dignified, fulfilling and productive lives with equal rights to others in society.

In each of the four communities surveyed, female and male victims of mine/ERW accidents (direct and indirect victims) were identified, and where possible interviewed. The following are some extracts from the interviews:

CASE STUDIES OF WOMEN
1. Bebi Gul is 50 years old. She has two sons. She was at home with her cousin (Anar Gul) when she was injured by a cluster bomb. She said that Anar Gul was pregnant and she lost the baby as a result of the bombing. Bebi Gul received emergency medical assistance from people in her community after the accident. She did not visit the clinic, since she “knew they would not help” her. She received assistance from the MoLSAMD in the form of notebooks and 9 kg of margarine. She eventually went to the Red Crescent hospital for help and treatment of her hand, but when hospital staff said that amputation of her hand was necessary, she refused and left. The survivor further informed that her husband remarried shortly after her accident, and that she believed he did so because of her paralyzed hand and leg. She pointed out that her son and his family is helping her “to be alive.”

2. 45 year-old Habiba narrated: “I will never forget the day that I lost my young son, who was killed in the cluster bomb attack 10 years ago. All our village area was contaminated by mines, so we migrated to a more peaceful district because here was dangerous. After the end of war the demining team came and cleaned the village. After the cleaning of mines we returned back home and we are satisfied with their work in our village”.

3. The husband of Mrs Abeda was killed in a mine accident while he wanted to complete the harvesting of the agricultural land in the summer. She has four children (two sons and two daughters). The elder son is 15 years old and he is now the main breadwinner of the family. He is earning just 300Afs/day and running the family economy. This money is not enough. The victim’s family members did not receive any assistance from
the government or from NGOs. She told that she is very worried about the future of her children, because they cannot to go to school and have to work. Another son has a nervous disorder, so she is requesting a treatment and cure to help him, and she needs to be provided with educational opportunities for her children.

4. Amena is the mother of a son who died in a landmine accident in 1372 (1993) while he was grazing sheep in Qala-e-Wardak area. She did not receive any assistance from any agencies or NGOs.

5. Mrs. Khorshaid from Qalat-i-Ghazi lost her husband because of a mine accident in 2002. The husband of Khorshaid was killed returning home with his sheep. Because of no assistance to her family, Khorshaid had to marry for a second time with the brother of her ex-husband. She is busy now with carpet making.

6. Atefa is a 45-year old woman, who became disabled in 1365 (1986) in Shakeeban village. Her husband is a farmer and they have five children, a cow and a few sheep. Their life is running with difficulties. They received MRE (after the accident). She said: "While my husband is working on the agricultural land I am scared and very worried about him”.

7. Mrs. Razeqa lost her husband, who was a teacher, in a mine accident in Shakeeban village in 1369 (1990), while he was travelling to school. She has five sons and one daughter. After her husband’s mine accident, she was faced with problems in bringing up the children. The villagers helped her family during these difficult years. Two years ago the Centre for the Disabled helped her through vocational courses. She said: “While my children are going to work on the land, I am very worried about them, because still we have mines in some places”.

CASE STUDIES OF MEN

1. Mr.Qadeer A. was injured during the Taliban regime in 1998. He worked as a farmer before the incident. The mine accident happened on a public path while he was transporting the wheat harvest home. He was not aware of MRE training. The Red Crescent assisted him with medical treatment. He did not receive any further assistance, but hopes to get vocational training to obtain a good job.

2. Mr. Najmoddin from Qala-i-Shater is married and has 10 family members. He worked as farm labourer before the mine incident, during which he lost the left leg. He did not receive any assistance from any agencies. He hopes to have a shop if someone will help him. His daily income at the moment is 300Afs. He said that he does not participate in wedding and religious programmes, because people don’t respect him and are looking at him as an abnormal and disabled person.

3. Mr. Wakeel A. is married and has four family members. He is 41-year old, who was a
farmer before the mine accident. Because of a delay in treatment, he was affected by Tetanus, which caused the doctors to amputate the leg. He got some assistance from MoLSAMD. Moreover the UNAMA gave him USD 2500. He would like to have a shop, but needs assistance to be able to do this.

4. Mr. Gul A. was injured, when he touched an ISAF cluster bomb. Unfortunately he did not know that it was dangerous and was curious about it. He lost his right leg. The expenditure of the treatment was borne by him. Nowadays a rich person helps him to run his life. A few times he went to MoLSAMD to get some assistance but it was in vain. Just four years ago the WFP give him 88kg wheat. He wishes to have a shop to support his 10 family members. At the moment his income is only 200 Afs/day.

5. Haji Faizolla told how he went to his agricultural land for work and that his own tractor was destroyed by a mine and that his friend, who was sitting with him on the tractor, had his leg broken. Another stranger was also killed. He did not receive any assistance. His younger son is working to feed them. He is nervous now and mentally ill, because of the mine incident.

6. Mr Sargen was killed in a mine incident in 1984. His family members did not receive any assistance. Now the victim’s two sons are working in the custom area and the wife of Sargen takes care of her sons. Haji Nezamoddin said: while we are talking about the mines and its incidents, so my daughter and grandchild are shouting and weeping, as they remember the incident with their father.

7. Mr. Wakeel Ahmad is 37-years old. He was injured in his village in 1372 (1993), while he went to visit his relatives. The mine accident happened on the bank of river and he lost his leg. He is a farmer and also received the vocational skill of carpenter. He worked as director of the Disability Centre for seven years, from 2003 to 2011.

8. Mr. Najeebulla is 40-years old. He has nine family members. He was injured in the spring of 1370 (1991) while he wanted to irrigate his land. The WFP is helping him, and he receives 50 Kg wheat each month. He has a small shop, but he has no private home. He wants to get vocational skills.

CASE STUDY OF GIRLS
1. Miss Shakeela is 16 years old and studying in seventh class of a private school. She was injured, while she played with her sister in the playground. She touched an explosive device and badly injured her spine. She was attended by the Red Crescent hospital, but still she remains paralyzed. Besides going to school she is embroidering. She said that her life is very difficult.

CASE STUDY OF BOYS
1. Mohammad is now a man, but was a young boy of five years old when he lost his left
leg in spring of 1375 (1996) while he was busy shepherding sheep. He got vocational education which was conducted by OMAR. He is studying in Abu Mansur high school, and has learned tailoring and embroidery skills. He needs financial investment in order to live his life productively.

BROADENED DEFINITION OF “VICTIM”

Afghanistan acceded to the Convention on Cluster Munitions (CCM) on 8 August 2011. The CCM officially broadens the definition of victims (Article 2), including not only the persons who have directly experienced an accident, (mainly men and boys) but also their affected families and communities, which include those (mainly women and girls) living with, depending on and becoming caregivers of survivors. It is generally accepted that gender influences the risk of becoming a victim of landmines/ERW, of accessing medical and psychological care, rehabilitation, long term socio-economic reintegration, and risk education. While men and boys represent the majority of direct victims and survivors in Afghanistan, it is important to recognise that women and girls make up the largest group of indirect victims, being the spouses, mothers, sisters and daughters of the men that are injured/disabled/killed by landmines and ERW.

SUPPORT FOR THE VICTIMS

The Table below shows (as in the survey of communities in the Central and Northern regions of Afghanistan) that few of the victims received compensation for their loss. Women in many communities pointed out that here has: “been no assistance for victims”

This exposes a patchy and inconsistent support system that is failing both direct and indirect victims.

The largest category of direct victims is men, who are at greatest risk while conducting farm work or travelling. The smaller number of children injured might reflect success by families and MRE teams in educating them about the dangers of mines. This evidence is in contrast to the general victim data in Afghanistan that states that children represent the majority of victims (included in the introduction).
Meeting to develop a time line for landmine/ERW accidents

Table 8: Victim support provided in the four surveyed communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of survivor or indirect victim</th>
<th>Sex of victim</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Organisat-</th>
<th>Kind of assistance</th>
<th>Money</th>
<th>Medical treatment</th>
<th>Food products</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>ion</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bebi Gul</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>MoLSAMD</td>
<td></td>
<td>1000 Afs</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>9Kg Oil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Habiba</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abeda</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amena</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qadeer A.</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>J-ibrael</td>
<td>OMAR/Red Cross</td>
<td>MRE</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gul A.</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>WFP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Najmoddin</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>Red Cross</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Artificial foot</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wakeel A</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>UNAMA/ MoLSAMD</td>
<td>USD2500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakeela</td>
<td>Girl</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>Red Cross</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil; yes</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atefa</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Razeqa</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>MoLASMD For 2 years</td>
<td></td>
<td>1000Af</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad</td>
<td>Boy</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>OMAR/ Red Cross</td>
<td>Vocational training</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Artificial foot</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Challenges Related to Victim Assistance

- Continuing insecurity and tribal conflicts
- Continued presence of hazards in communities
- High poverty and illiteracy (which can reduce their ability to seek appropriate help and also to find suitable employment)
- Lack of awareness about the mines/ERW
- Lack of awareness about victim’s rights and programmes to support them
- Shortage of funds to provide victim assistance and MRE in all parts of Afghanistan
- Inconsistent support to victims
- Patchy coverage and capacity of disability organisations

In Shakeeban, the women provided accident and victim data (below) that was in sharp contrast (much higher) to that provided by the men (and to that in the MACCA IMSMA database):

- About 200-300 persons killed in mine explosions – mainly boys and men
- About 100 animals killed in mine accidents
- About 500 persons with disabilities
- About 8 people were killed by landmines after demining

A possible explanation for this discrepancy is that women are less aware of the reality in the community, due to the fact that they are confined to household activities.

### Conclusions (Victim Assistance)

- Most accidents occurred spring and summer; men are at greatest risk. The smaller number of children injured might reflect successful MRE
- Both mental and physical trauma (e.g. Qala-i-Shater)
- Little government support to survivors or indirect victims
- Patchy and inconsistent VA (that relies on broader disability services) is failing both direct and indirect victims

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Assistance Received</th>
<th>Literacy/Training</th>
<th>One Bag of Wheat per Month</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Najeebulla Man</td>
<td></td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>Red Cross/WFP, OMAR Handicap Int</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wakeel A. Man</td>
<td></td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>OMAR MRE, Voc Tr</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haji Faizulla Man</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Qalate Ghazi</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haji Nezamoddin Man</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Qalate Ghazi</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khorshaid Woman</td>
<td></td>
<td>Qalate Ghazi</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RECOMMENDATIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)

- Apply the official definition of “victim”, ensuring indirect victims are included (recognizing CCM’s broadened definition of “victim” 24) in any VA related activities, and that all victims’ needs and priorities are taken into consideration in an age and gender sensitive way
- Collect victim data, disaggregated by sex and age
- Develop a register of all direct and indirect landmine/ERW victims
- Link victims to support organisations, including MoLSAMD, MoE, MoPH
- Support these organisations through advocacy, training and technical assistance
- Recognise and take into consideration accessibility issues of female survivors and victims when designing and implementing VA activities
- Deploy female VA staff members to ensure affected women and girls can be reached (for example through house to house visits), and that their needs and priorities are taken into consideration
- Advocate the Afghanistan government, and remind it of its treaty obligations under the APMBC and the CCM, to ensure that all mine/ERW victims and persons with disabilities have equal and full access to adequate, affordable, gender and age sensitive emergency and continued medical care, physical rehabilitation, psychosocial support, social and economic inclusion services and legal assistance25
- Sensitize affected women about their rights, and ensure any sensitization campaigns are carried out in an age and gender sensitive manner, taking into consideration illiteracy and access issues.

CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT

INTRODUCTION

The Terms of Reference for this survey include a capacity development objective, which was to:

Ensure the MAPA, in partnership with Afghan social scientists, can conduct such surveys on a periodic basis and analyse the data using the SL model and, specifically, to:

a. provide further training for surveyors from the MAPA in data collection using the Landmine and Livelihoods (L&L) approach
b. introduce additional Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) tools to allow MACCA, DMC and IPs to use L&L surveys in support of a variety of objectives (e.g. community needs assessments as well as post-demining assessments)

24 Victim means: “all persons who have been killed or suffered physical or psychological injury, economic loss, social marginalisation or substantial impairment of the realisation of their rights caused by the use of cluster munitions. They include those persons directly impacted by cluster munitions as well as their affected families and communities.” Convention on Cluster Munitions, Article 2, May 2008, http://www.clusterconvention.org/files/2011/01/Convention-ENG.pdf
25 Cartagena Action Plan, Action # 31: Ensure appropriate services are available and accessible to female and male victim
c. conduct a small (up to seven communities) L&L survey for practical training of the surveyors and social scientists, test new PRA tools, and obtain L&L data
d. train and mentor Afghan social scientists in the analysis and reporting of L&L data using the Sustainable Livelihoods (SL) model
e. obtain farming systems data from secondary sources for use in Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) of demining

MEETING THE SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES

This objective has been mostly met. Further training was provided to MACCA, DMC, IP, AIRD and CSO staff in data collection using the L&L approach. The training course content can be found in a separate document (Report on Training on the use of Livelihood Survey Tool, October 2011).

The tools used in the first L&L survey (Central and Northern Regions) were modified to make them more effective. The use of wealth ranking was suggested but rejected by experienced surveyors as being too sensitive for the Herat area.

The survey was conducted in four contrasting communities with teams of female and male surveyors supported by local and international social scientists.

A 3-day report writing “write-shop” was held in Dubai with the international livelihoods expert, the international gender and mine action expert, MACCA and AIRD staff during which the field data were analysed and written up in draft form. This forms the basis of the core section of this report on the findings, conclusions and recommendations from the survey.

Patchy and incomplete farming systems data was obtained from the field. Secondary sources have not been consulted.

OVERALL IMPRESSION OF LIVELIHOOD CAPACITY

This has to be broken down into several components: a) the capacity of survey staff to implement the fieldwork competently; b) the academic and practical capacity of social scientists to design, monitor, analyse and report the surveys, and c) the capacity of MAPA to commission and coordinate Livelihood surveys.

The capacity of survey staff

Two L&L surveys have now been successfully completed with the participation of male and female IP staff and LIAT surveyors. However, neither survey was able to gather a comprehensive and complete set of data. Despite an improvement in the second survey, there is a continuing problem of rushing the interviews and not following up checklist questions with secondary enquiry (probing).

The capacity of social scientists

Two Afghan social scientists from AIRD were involved in the first L&L survey. They were
very competent, but have unfortunately since left AIRD. Four Afghan social scientists were contracted for the second L&L survey, two from AIRD and two from CSO (a man and a woman from each organisation). These took part in the training and implementation of the survey, and one was fully involved in the analysis and report writing exercise in Dubai. This has considerably enhanced the competence within Afghanistan to support future surveys. However, the main competence and appreciation of the Livelihoods approach still resides with the two MACCA staff (Samim Hashimi and Qudous Ziaee).

The capacity of MAPA
As mentioned above, there is a good level of understanding of the whole L&L survey process and academic rational within MACCA. In addition two DMC staff have been closely and enthusiastically involved in both L&L surveys.

CONCLUSIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)
A combination of MACCA, DMC and AIRD support would still be needed to design, implement, analyse and report similar L&L surveys in the future. However, it is felt that this could now be achieved without the need for involvement of international scientists.

RECOMMENDATIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)
- Conduct a further small pilot L&L survey using Afghan personnel for all aspects.
- As recommended in the section on Development Outcomes, MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints
- Continue, and build on, the partnership with AIRD
- Training in L&L should be provided to the 22 existing focal points and other key people to widen the understanding of livelihoods and development across relevant Afghan organisations.
Training of survey staff in the use of livelihood analysis tools
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR MAPA

The following section brings together all the conclusion and recommendations from the individual components of the report. Overall the survey was successful in meeting its objectives, and has gathered a wealth of useful information, providing numerous recommendations for the improvement of mine action in Afghanistan. When taken together with other surveys and audits this provides the evidence needed for decision making and change.

CONCLUSIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)

• Clearance enables a wide range of land and non-land activities/employment, encourages investment, reduces fear and enables the return of refugees/IDPs
• Mine action enables better education (building of schools, safer access to schools for children and teachers)
• Mine action enables better health (reduced death and injury; building of clinics and safe access for staff; rehabilitation of water sources)
• Clearance creates opportunities for large scale enterprises (e.g. sugar beet, dairy, brick-making in Qalat-i-Ghazi)
• Homogeneous communities seem most self-reliant and development oriented (community contributions – e.g. Jibrael). Combined with strong, benign leadership from wealthy landowners this can result in accelerated development following the removal of hazards
• The economic value of assets increases dramatically following clearance. As asset values change, there is a need to re-assess crop/livestock returns as a function of land values to see if they are still the most viable option
• Communities and individuals (including victims) need capital/credit to start or expand their businesses
• They also need vocational and literacy training and training facilities
• Daily and seasonal activities vary hugely by gender, age, occupation and wealth, and there are marked gender roles and responsibilities (but these can be flexible according to circumstance)
• Some aid dependence was noted in one community (Qala-i-Shater)
• Few development agencies (government, NGO or private) are active and effective in rural areas

RECOMMENDATIONS (DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES AND IMPACT)

• MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints
• The Unit should also conduct economic analysis of development options so as to be able to give appropriate advice to agencies
• The Unit should consider the considerable diversity within and between communities (gender, age, wealth, ethnicity, environmental, political...), and adapt tools and activities accordingly
• Mine action and development should be linked through the coordination of communication, monitoring, research and development initiatives between focal points in a network of relevant development agencies (government, NGO, private, donor) by the MAPA Liaison Officer
• An initial step in developing this coordinated network could be the training of the 22 existing focal points and other key people in a workshop designed to ensure the focal persons understand the relationships between mine action activities and improved livelihoods for community members
• Information related to development needs and priorities should be shared with development organizations to strengthen the link between mine action and development
• In order to maximize the developmental benefits for women, ensure their development priorities are taken into account in information gathering prioritization processes and in post clearance activities, and that all information is disaggregated by sex and age
• The video materials obtained during the survey should be reviewed (perhaps together with still photographs taken during the two L&L surveys) to make a short film that illustrates: a) the tools used in the survey; b) the impact of mine action on rural and urban communities. The film can be used for training and for advocacy.

CONCLUSIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
Although the amount of quantitative data collected by the survey teams was insufficient in most cases, the land value data suggests that demining in these four communities has been, on balance, a sound investment in economic terms.

RECOMMENDATIONS (ECONOMIC RETURNS)
• the MACCA and the GICHD should investigate secondary sources for (i) farming systems studies and (ii) land values
• the MACCA and the GICHD should conduct a second workshop on ‘good enough’ economic analysis of demining projects for social scientists from AIRD, and for senior personnel in the MACCA and the MAPA partners who are responsible for socio-economic surveys or heavily involved in planning and prioritisation
• the MACCA and the MAPA partners should re-assess their survey forms for quantitative socio-economic data, modify it if necessary based on the outcomes of

26 Cartagena Action Plan Action # 25: Collect and analyse all necessary data in a sex and age disaggregated manner
27 A preliminary workshop was held in March 2011 following the stakeholders workshop for the initial L&L Survey.
the economic analysis workshop, and re-train survey teams to ensure they can bring back adequate quantitative data for analysis.

CONCLUSIONS (PRIORITISATION)
Although the results from only four communities out of a total of 2115 impacted communities in Afghanistan could not provide a full understanding of people’s perception on priority setting process of MAPA, they indicate that the people have no complaints and are happy with the process. The findings of the survey encourage MACCA and the DMC to retain the criteria used for selection of the areas for clearance; however the recommendations below will further improve the process:

RECOMMENDATIONS (PRIORITISATION)
• MAPA should give similar priority to mental trauma caused by accidents as to physical injury (the bombardment of Qala-i-Shater provides a good example of long-term mental trauma)
• The suggestions made by local people on accelerating the process of clearing the remaining contaminated areas within their communities should be gathered and acted upon where appropriate
• There should be an annual review of local clearance priorities through liaison with the communities; thus, MACCA can ensure community involvement and can have a better understanding of the on-going needs of the communities affected by mines/ERW.
• Demining organizations should consult with communities as part of the process of selection of the next areas for clearance, and should be aware of village development plans (e.g. planned location of new schools etc.)
• Since women, girls, boys and men (and also poorer and better off people) within a community have different exposure to hazards; separate meetings should be conducted with different groups in order to make sure their needs are addressed
• All information should be collected and analysed in a sex and age disaggregated manner, in order to take into account the different priorities of all age and sex groups
• Female MA staff members should be deployed when collecting prioritization-related information from affected communities, facilitating the access to female community members
• Women should be ensured meaningful participation at priority-setting meetings and their views should be taken into account and reflected in the final ranking of priorities
• Considering the daily and seasonal activities of female and male community members will help understand when is a good time to arrange meetings to find out about their clearance priorities
• Analyzing the past recorded civilian accidents will help to find out in which season of the year the people mostly become landmine victims. The findings can be fed into clearance operations and MRE messages.
RECOMMENDATIONS (INFORMATION SHARING)

• Improve access to women through the deployment of female mine action staff members
• Ensure women receive first-hand information, through female mine action staff reaching out to women and sharing information directly
• Ensure women are included in handover procedures, and that they receive first-hand information related to which areas have been cleared, and which are safe to use
• Monitor information sharing with women and men post clearance through post clearance sex disaggregated community data
• Organize meetings with community women, utilizing local structures like women’s Shura. This can be an effective way of reaching out to, and including women, taking into consideration their needs, priorities and capabilities
• Ensure information sharing is age and gender sensitive, taking into consideration the level of education and illiteracy issues

CONCLUSIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)

MACCA has been successful with the QA and QC of the outputs of demining operations. Where there have been quality problems in the de-mining operation, these have been investigated and rectified. However, the lessons learned from these investigations and records of QA and QC have not been properly tracked for avoiding further undesired events.

In Jibrael there were mine accidents following supposed clearance. However, this was due to exceptional circumstances (deeply buried mines [by wind-blown soils and flood sediments] and the construction of buildings requiring deep foundations and heavy machinery). In correct fashion, an enquiry was held and a second clearance is underway which has found only one mine.

RECOMMENDATIONS (QUALITY MANAGEMENT)

• Establish a strong quality management process that focuses not only on the quality of the actual clearance operations, but also ensures that clearance is “fit for purpose” – i.e. it takes into account the intended use of the cleared land.
• Continue strengthening processes (e.g. livelihoods and PDIA surveys and the use of the Balanced Scorecard approach) that assess post-handover outcomes, impacts and opportunities
• Add a strong, clear and routine community liaison process to the QA process of MACCA QM to ensure involvement of female and male community members in mine action planning, implementation and outcome assessment
• Include QA of victim assistance activities in MACCA QM as these are poor at present.

Cartagena Action Plan, Action Point # 15: Involve women and men in handover
CONCLUSIONS (MRE)

- All villages received some MRE (men, girls and boys more than the women).
- Coverage is not complete. Not all children attend school and many women have restricted mobility
- There is no evidence of female MRE staff interacting with female community members in three of the four communities

RECOMMENDATIONS (MRE)

- Recognise and take into consideration MRE accessibility challenges for women and girls when planning MRE visits
- Ensure MRE activities take into account the particular exposure of boys and men, and that activities at the time of accident are recorded when collecting accident data, in order to enable the tailoring and targeting of MRE to gender related exposure and behavior
- Consider and use the KAPB-related information on women and girls, and make sure MRE activities are tailored and designed on the basis of this information, taking into consideration female-specific roles and responsibilities that result in exposure to landmines/ERW²⁹
- Design and implement MRE activities, recognizing the seasonal variations in all community members’ gender specific roles and responsibilities
- Conduct MRE follow-up sessions, in particular in Qalat-i-Ghazi and Qala-i-Shater focusing on risky behaviour
- Ministry of Education should take more responsibilities in areas where the MAPA MRE resources are not available.
- Further develop the MRE multi-media campaign to reach more people through different channels
- Deploy all-female MRE teams in order to ensure female community members are directly included in MRE activities
- Identify and train female MRE volunteers wherever possible and teachers in affected communities within government networks (NSP, local network and MoPH health workers)
- Ensure that MRE is communicated through gender and age sensitive channels, and that challenges like illiteracy, which is highly gendered, is taken into consideration when designing MRE materials
- Include more specific questions on MRE when designing future surveys. The survey teams must understand the questions and must provide a full set of data to facilitate the report writing.

²⁹ Cartagena Action Plan Action # 52: … assistance should be based on appropriate surveys, needs analysis, age-appropriate and gender sensitive strategies
CONCLUSIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)

- Most accidents occurred spring and summer; men are at greatest risk. The smaller number of children injured might reflect successful MRE
- Both mental and physical trauma (e.g. Qala-i-Shater)
- Little government support to survivors or indirect victims
- Patchy and inconsistent VA (that relies on broader disability services) is failing both direct and indirect victims

RECOMMENDATIONS (VICTIM ASSISTANCE)

- Apply the official definition of “victim”, ensuring indirect victims are included (recognizing CCM’s broadened definition of “victim” 30) in any VA related activities, and that all victims’ needs and priorities are taken into consideration in an age and gender sensitive way
- Collect victim data, disaggregated by sex and age
- Develop a register of all direct and indirect landmine/ERW victims
- Link victims to support organisations, including MoLSAMD, MoE, MoPH
- Support these organisations through advocacy, training and technical assistance
- Recognise and take into consideration accessibility issues of female survivors and victims when designing and implementing VA activities
- Deploy female VA staff members to ensure affected women and girls can be reached (for example through house to house visits), and that their needs and priorities are taken into consideration
- Advocate the Afghanistan government, and remind it of its treaty obligations under the APMBC and the CCM, to ensure that all mine/ERW victims and persons with disabilities have equal and full access to adequate, affordable, gender and age sensitive emergency and continued medical care, physical rehabilitation, psychosocial support, social and economic inclusion services and legal assistance31
- Sensitize affected women about their rights, and ensure any sensitization campaigns are carried out in an age and gender sensitive manner, taking into consideration illiteracy and access issues.

CONCLUSIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)

A combination of MACCA, DMC and AIRD support would still be needed to design, implement, analyse and report similar L&L surveys in the future. However, it is felt that this could now be achieved without the need for involvement of international scientists.

---

30 Victim means: “all persons who have been killed or suffered physical or psychological injury, economic loss, social marginalisation or substantial impairment of the realisation of their rights caused by the use of cluster munitions. They include those persons directly impacted by cluster munitions as well as their affected families and communities.” Convention on Cluster Munitions, Article 2, May 2008, http://www.clusterconvention.org/files/2011/01/Convention-ENG.pdf
31 Cartagena Action Plan, Action # 31: Ensure appropriate services are available and accessible to female and male victim
RECOMMENDATIONS (CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT)

- Conduct a further small pilot L&L survey using Afghan personnel for all aspects.
- As recommended in the section on Development Outcomes, MAPA should consider establishing a research and development unit within MACCA or in partnership with AIRD (using livelihoods and other approaches to sustainable development) to conduct further surveys and to follow up / document development outcomes, to support opportunities and overcome challenges/constraints.
- Continue, and build on, the partnership with AIRD.
- Training in L&L should be provided to the 22 existing focal points and other key people to widen the understanding of livelihoods and development across relevant Afghan organisations.
# ANNEXES

## ANNEX 1

**Participants in the Herat Landmines and Livelihoods Training and Survey**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Duty station</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Samim Hashimi</td>
<td>Sr. MRE Projects Manager</td>
<td>MACCA</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Qudos Ziaee</td>
<td>Operations Projects Manager</td>
<td>MACCA</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gul Agha Mirzai</td>
<td>Sr. SOP Manager</td>
<td>DMC</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Habib Rahimi</td>
<td>Sr. Manual Manager</td>
<td>DMC</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shapur Qayyumi</td>
<td>Research Officer</td>
<td>AIRD</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gulalai Habib</td>
<td>Data Analysis Manager</td>
<td>AIRD</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad Maseeh</td>
<td>Mahram</td>
<td>AIRD</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Kabir</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakeeba</td>
<td>GIS Director</td>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Azam</td>
<td>Mahram</td>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Rafiq</td>
<td>MRE supervisor</td>
<td>OMAR</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kochai</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>OMAR</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gholam Mustafa</td>
<td>Mahram</td>
<td>OMAR</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Hadi</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>DDG</td>
<td>Mazar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmoud Rafi</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>DDG</td>
<td>Mazar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamid Haidari</td>
<td>MRE instructor</td>
<td>ARCS</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anahita</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>ARCS</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Qader</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Najiba</td>
<td>MRE Instructor</td>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalilurahman</td>
<td>LIAT team Leader</td>
<td>MCPA</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Ibrahim</td>
<td>LIAT Surveyor</td>
<td>MCPA</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Ayaz</td>
<td>LIAT team Leader</td>
<td>MCPA</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naimatullah</td>
<td>LIAT Surveyor</td>
<td>MCPA</td>
<td>Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry Pound</td>
<td>International Scientist</td>
<td>GICHD</td>
<td>UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Åsa Massleberg</td>
<td>International Scientist</td>
<td>GICHD/GMAP</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malika</td>
<td>Translator</td>
<td>AMAC</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aram</td>
<td>Translator</td>
<td>Freelance</td>
<td>Herat</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**ANNEX 2**

**MACCA database information on the 4 selected villages**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S #</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Device Destroyed</th>
<th>Number of Hazard Cleared</th>
<th>Total of Hazard Area Cleared</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Province</td>
<td>District</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Distance from centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Injil</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>from Pro 8 km</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>From Pro 10km</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Kohsan</td>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi</td>
<td>From Pro 140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Zendjan</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>From Pro 60Km</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S #</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Number of Hazard Remained</th>
<th>Total Hazard Area remained</th>
<th>Type of the Device contamination In Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Province</td>
<td>District</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Distance from centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Injil</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S #</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Number of People Received MRE</td>
<td>Clearance Organizations Involved</td>
<td>Beneficiary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Province</td>
<td>Distric t</td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>Distance from centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Injil</td>
<td>Qala-i-Shater</td>
<td>from Pro 8 km</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td>Jibrael</td>
<td>From Pro 10km</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Kohsan</td>
<td>Qalat-i-Ghazi</td>
<td>From Pro 140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Herat</td>
<td>Zendajan</td>
<td>Shakeeban</td>
<td>From Pro 60Km</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jibrael, Centre District, Herat Province
Visited 25-26 October 2011 by Teams B and D.

Jibrael is a suburb of Herat, located about 10 km from the centre of Herat just south of the Herat-Meshed road. It occupies a flat area and is characterised by a large amount of construction, mostly of good-sized, detached multi-storey buildings for residence and business. In the construction area all walls are marked with a tick, signifying they are clear of hazards. About two-thirds of the 300ha contaminated area has been cleared. Most of the residents are Shia Hazaras, with a great sense of unity and cohesion. The population of Jibrael is said to be around 10,000. Before clearance there was only one house on the site. There are now some 600.

The survey here took a while to start as the leader of the Shura did not want to have a long meeting that day. Phone calls to and from the AMAC convinced him to cooperate (and all was friendly in the end). As in other villages, the team was very well prepared with equipment, assigned roles, appropriate clothing and good written reference material. Team members knew their assignments and started them without discussion. They had prepared written lists of questions for each tool. Their body language and manner was excellent during questioning, and they enabled good participation in the making of maps.

Community members assisting in making the map

The men’s team met the Shura and other senior members of the community (including the cultural leader, the Islamic leader and the main land owner) at the Shura meeting room (which has a good map of the minefields prominently on its wall).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Time started</th>
<th>Time finished</th>
<th>Minutes for the tool</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arrival and starting up</td>
<td>0830</td>
<td>0920</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introductions</td>
<td>0920</td>
<td>0950</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time line + questions</td>
<td>0950</td>
<td>1025</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map + questions</td>
<td>1050</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although a vast anti-tank mine contaminated area was cleared during 1996 -2006 by one of the demining organizations using dogs, however, it was not fully successful, as after it was handed over to the community, the people decided to make it a residential area; around ten accidents happened, which resulted in death and injuries to 24 persons, and the destruction of eight vehicles. This caused people to
stop working. The investigation of the accidents after the clearance revealed that the main cause of the accidents was that flooding and wind had resulted in earth covering the mines to a depth that was undetectable by the dogs, especially in the prevailing high winds. When digging foundations or using heavy vehicles, the mines were triggered. According to the focus group discussion, men stated that: “After the accidents happened in cleared areas, we lost our trust in mine action; however, we requested the mine action to re-survey and clear the whole area”. Consequently, re-clearance was approved in 2009 after a proper survey was conducted. The re-clearance (by HALO Trust) is still on-going. However, the survey indicated that in most parts of the area modern houses have been built and it is not possible to conduct full clearance operations unless the houses are destroyed.

HALO Trust compound

A school, clinic, mosque, electricity supply and water channel, as well as many residential buildings have already been built on the cleared land. 15,000 trees have been planted so far. 5ha of land has been walled off and preserved for farming. The electricity and water channel for washing and livestock were put in with the resources of the residents (resident families contributed 1500 Afghanis = USD 30 each for the electricity supply) and the main landowner family of 9 brothers (they contributed USD117,000 towards the electricity supply and USD 95,000 for the water supply).

Mosque and residential houses built on cleared land

There remain various major development problems, the main ones being a clean, drinking water system, and the expansion of educational facilities for the children. The government was criticized for not supporting the community enough. They feel they are paying taxes and not getting much in return. They also want vocational training to enable them to get employment.
The Arbub describes the rehabilitation of the water channel to the men’s team

In later discussion with the female survey team it appears that there have been several land disputes over plots sold to residents (returnees).

Female survey team impressions
The meeting with female community members was held at a private boys’ and girls’ school located in the centre of the community. The survey team first met with the male principle of the school, who helped in organizing a group of eight female teachers. The survey team used the introduction, time line and map tools during this first meeting.

Time line
All the women grew up in Iran, so therefore had little information about the war in this particular area. They all belong to the Shia Hazara tribe. According to the women, all people who live in the community are refugee returnees from either Iran or Pakistan. The women left for Iran when the Russian invasion started in the 1980s. The women returned to the area at different times, and received MRE at the Iran – Afghan border. They have also received MRE in the community, delivered by female and male teams.

According to the women, between 15 – 20 persons have been killed / injured in cleared areas. Also, the women claimed that no investigations took place in the area after the accidents happened with the missed landmines.

Among other things, a mosque, schools and a clinic have been constructed in the cleared area. There is not so much agricultural land in the area. The main impact from clearance has been construction. There are remaining minefields in the area that need to be cleared. After clearance of the land, many more people were interested in buying land in the area.

Land disputes
According to the women, there are many land-disputes in the area. When asked about the reasons for these disputes, the women said that clearance resulted in many people being interested in buying the cleared, safe land. This same group also informed that there have been numerous incidents of land disputes following clearance. The land disputes were believed to have been caused by the landowners selling the same plot of land to as many as four buyers. It also appears that there is a Shia/Sunni struggle going on (the minority Shia Hazaras are supported by Iran, while most other Afghans are Sunni). According to the women, there are about 100 cases of one piece of land being sold to more than one person. The Shura leader was involved in solving such land disputes in the community. These land disputes were not highlighted by the interviewed men in the same community.
Qalat-i-Ghazi, Kohsan District, Herat Province

Visited 23-24 October 2011 by Teams B and D.

Qalat-i-Ghazi is a medium-sized village very close (c.10km) to the Iran border, and close to the main Herat-Meshed road, said to be used for smuggling opium on its way to Europe. There were several minefields totalling nearly 500 hectares (5km²). These are situated fairly close to the village on agricultural and grazing land. About half the mined area has been cleared and villagers are very happy about that and the performance of the de-miners.

Map showing the relationship between cleared and un-cleared minefields and the community

There are several very large, opulent houses in the village with at least 4 of these owned by one family (the family of Arbab Zarif) in whose houses the men’s and the women’s teams met. The family own 900 jirib (around 180ha) of land, part of which has been cleared and part of which is still mined. The Arbab expects to use almost all the land for agricultural purposes. He would like to establish a sugar beet plantation with a sugar factory on the site. He reckons this could employ up to 1000 people, which would be of benefit to the local (and national) economy. However, he needs investment capital to make this happen. The FAO representative in Herat was made aware of this opportunity. He would also like to establish a dairy for sale of milk locally and in Herat. There is also brick works at present employing 150 people.

Interview with better-off members of the community

Water for irrigation is a major problem for the community as a whole. Deep boreholes are needed to provide the water (the river runs close to the village, but is not flowing at this season).
A second cleared area (on the east side of the road) is owned by many small landowners. Mines were also laid on the Iran side of the border to stop trafficking and the incursion of mujahedeen fighters during the war. Apparently Kuchi nomads (we saw a caravan on the road) are not affected by the minefields on the Afghan side as they don’t approach the border for fear of getting shot by border guards.

The CDC and the District Development Authority (representatives of which were at our meeting) are active in the village and the CDC erected water tanks for drinking water. The high school (see interview with boys and photo) was established by UNICEF.

![Interview with boys at the High School](image)

**Female survey team**
The meetings were held in the village leader’s house. His two wives and other female family members cooked the lunch for the female and the male survey teams.

**Focus Group Discussions**
A group of five poorer women who had been identified during the previous day’s wealth ranking exercise came to the house. A group of wealthier women had been interviewed the previous day. The women were aware that clearance activities had been ongoing in the community. Information had been shared to them by their husbands. Likewise, when clearance was completed, the women were informed accordingly by their husbands. The women are very happy about the mine action activities. “All areas were so dangerous, we were worried when our men and children were going outside.”

The women are not aware of any landmines being discovered in the area after it had been cleared. Main land uses in cleared areas have been related to cultivation activities, but women are only involved in cultivation activities to a limited extent. In terms of land ownership, the women believe that once the land has been cleared, it is owned by the community. People who own the land had their land certificates before the clearance.

No land disputes are known to the women. “Sometimes the village leader decides who can use the land.” The value of the land before clearance was very low, and now the land prices have increased. Women are not aware of any future development plans for the area. The women have informed the village leader about their problems and needs. The village leader is supposed to take these to the province level. Women’s development priorities include:

- Electricity
- Schools
Before clearance, some of the women had no land to use for cultivation. After clearance, they can use cleared land for cultivation. Some women grow water melons in the area. Only one out of the six ladies owns land, the others are paid to work on other households’ land. Women who are alone are not allowed to own land. Single women can own houses. When asked about the price of the land, the women informed that the value of the land varies. They also informed that “there is a lot of land available.” However, it’s hard to cultivate the land, because it is so dry. Watermelon and wheat can produce under these conditions. Women feel safe when they walk around the area, they don’t worry about landmines any longer.

“Thanks to the mine action organizations we now feel safe. We don’t worry about the mines and accidents.”

Qala-i-Shater, Injil District, Herat Province
Visited 25-26 October 2011 by Teams A and C.

Qala-i-Shater is an established village on the outskirts of Herat about 8km east from the centre of the city. It has a canal going through it with a plentiful supply of flowing water. Two minefields have been cleared on hills outside the residential area. There is also an army camp that still has contamination of weapons caches, which are being cleared by WRA (an international organisation specialised in that work). The irrigated agricultural land cleared around the camp is being used by the army personnel for alfalfa and grazing. The government has decided that the army camp should be fully cleared and then converted into an eco-park (ecological green space for villagers). The decision had been made in a meeting between the government and the EU in 2006, but the villagers had little idea about it.

The interviews with men were held at the mosque. We arrived around 9am and immediately community members started arriving, including quite a few disabled people with missing limbs/eyes. One was disabled from birth, not by mine accident. It seemed that they were under the impression that we would give them assistance of some sort.

After Moh Rafiq explained our visit, we divided into two groups – one interviewing survivors and the other doing daily clocks and seasonal calendars. At the same time a group of boys waited patiently to be
interviewed. We also interviewed the head of the Shura separately on video. He told the story of mine action in the village.

Interview (with video) of the head of the shura

The group for the daily clock/seasonal calendar was very mixed (driver, disabled ex-de-miner for HALO Trust, market stall holder who sells mobile phone credit and is also the father of a mine accident survivor, student, farmer, old man). Most people (apart from Shura head) appeared poor, and were more difficult to interview than richer people who are more articulate and seem to understand the questions easier. Of the survivors, one impressed us with his good attitude to life, never giving up hope and actively looking for work. The Coalition forces bombing of the village towards the end of the war was very intense here and this event severely traumatised some residents as well as leaving unexploded cluster bombs in the water channel. The number of survivors is at odds with the number in the MACCA database (zero!).

Female team
The community knew that the team would visit. Women were waiting for them in a meeting point in the community center. The team was welcomed by the women, and they said they would give them their time. Mainly ERW (a lot of cluster munitions) contamination, and not so many landmines. Most ERW had been left behind around water points, in 2001. Bombing raids were also carried out by coalition forces in 2001. The main impacts of clearance have been construction of houses, and other buildings. There is a concern among the women in the community, and they are still worried that the area around the military area is still contaminated. There is a lack of schools in and close to the community, so the children have to go quite a long way. This has resulted in fewer children having the possibility to go to school.

The team experienced difficulties on the second day of visiting this village. Women in the community had heard that an organisation would distribute food and medicine, so many women showed up in the room where the meeting was arranged to take place. The expectations of the community women were very high – they expected the survey team to provide them with food and medicine. Despite these difficult circumstances, the survey team managed the situation well, and explained to the women they were not in a position to help them out with food and medicine.
Shakeeban, Zendajan District, Herat Province
Visited on 23-24 October 2011 by Teams A and C.

Shakeeban is a small town on the south side of the main Herat-Meshed road (about 2km down a dirt road). It is about 40 minutes drive from Herat. The town has shops, a Community Development Council building, a Disability Centre, high schools (separate schools for girls and boys), electricity, mobile phone coverage and other amenities. 21 hand pumps were supplied by UNAMA/DACCAR, but most of these are useless because they were wrongly located (little consultation). Houses are mainly traditional - mud, straw and brick-built. The town is about 2 km north of the main river (dry at the time of the visit). The inhabitants are pretty homogeneous ethnically, with most coming from the Mowdi tribe (Turkmens). This has resulted in good community cohesion. There are no Taliban fighters.

Main street, Shakeeban

The men’s survey team met the head of the shura and 14 other senior community members at the disability rehabilitation centre. The community is managed, and its development activities co-ordinated, by the shura.

Activities timetable for the men’s survey team (first day only):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0840</td>
<td>Left Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0900</td>
<td>Arrived Shakeeban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0930</td>
<td>Met with village leaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0940</td>
<td>Time line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1000</td>
<td>Map / FGD poorer men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1035</td>
<td>FGD richer men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1100</td>
<td>FGD boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1130</td>
<td>Visits to disability victim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1200</td>
<td>Visit to High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1230</td>
<td>Left village for Herat</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Arrangements were made to interview survivors, conduct farmer interviews and do daily clocks and seasonal calendars on Day 2.

Shakeeban was in the front line of the civil war, and so heavily mined. Two minefields have been cleared and one is under clearance. We were told that >1000 livestock were killed by mines in addition to cars, machinery, tractors. Water tunnels and agricultural land was also affected. There has been no compensation for loss of livelihoods in this way.

There were 9 survivors (4 adults and 5 children). Arrangements were made to interview 2 survivors the next day.
There were no land disputes as most people have a land title certificate (land has been handed down from father to sons). There is no government land apart from where the CDC office is located.

80% of the population left the town during the troubles and returned from 1371 (1992) when land mine clearance started.

**Development issues, Shakeeban**

UN Habitat provides micro-finance to those who meet its criteria, as well as a community fund for those in need (this is small and doesn’t rectify all the community problems).

The most serious problem in the community is the lack of water, both drinking and for irrigation. The river is 2 kms away, and dry at present due to the season and the drought. Diarrhoea is frequent and the amount of vegetables and crops has decreased due to the drought. They believe that shallow sub-surface water (that they are using for washing, drinking etc.) is contaminated by faecal matter. The few water wells are also open, leading to contamination. Deep boreholes would probably solve this problem, but they are looking to government to provide this. They would like to be self-sufficient with sustainable solutions. In addition to drought, flooding has been a problem in the past. About 10 years ago it flooded right up to the main road; crops and 70 houses were destroyed.

The area where a school is located used to be a minefield. A second cleared MF now includes a clinic. The third is still being cleared.

**Disability Centre**

The Centre is open to all (men, women, girls and boys) with any type of disability (including mental). It opened 16 years ago, funded by UNDP/UNOPS and OCHA. It is now supported by Handicap International. It has its own committee made up of the disabled, the community and the government. It has 4 activities:

- e) Awareness raising of disability and how to minimize it through MRE
- f) Physiotherapy
- g) Inclusion of those with disability into community affairs
- h) Capacity/confidence building for the disabled

The Centre has a 6-month project coordinated by MACCA/DMC, implemented by OMAR and paid for by the Italian government. This mainly centres around vocational training and the provision of materials in: tailoring, carpet making, carpentry and plumbing. The community is very happy with this project which provides skills and income to support the family.
We visited a lady who was disabled by polio. She is a widow, and tailors to provide money for her grandchildren.

The female survey team made up of three female surveyors met with a total of 12 ladies and four boys and three girls. The meeting was held in a “community meeting” room. One of the ladies who attended the meeting is the leader of the women’s Shura.

At the beginning of the meeting many of the women said that they don’t know if there are any mined areas “maybe the men know.” The women said that 200 – 300 people were killed by landmines in this village (over the past 17 – 18 years), and that most of the victims were boys and men. 100 animals have
been killed. The women estimate that there is a total of 500 persons with disabilities in the village. Most of the women lived in Iran as refugees during the war. Many of them returned to the village about 17 – 18 years ago. When they returned to the village, a team of women delivered MRE to them. Most clearance activities were completed around 2006. “Most areas have now been cleared.” Amongst the buildings constructed on the cleared land are a school and a clinic.

Land ownership related issues
“Most have certificate of the land they own.” No land-disputes are known to the women. The women don’t know how many landmines are left to be cleared. One area (Qroug) is believed to be mined. No people live in this area, it is used for wood collection from the nearby forest.

Main benefits of clearance activities
A considerable amount of construction has taken place in cleared areas. The community women informed us that 200 shops have been built in the cleared area, along with a school and other facilities such as cultural associations. The main land-uses in the cleared areas are cultivation activities. Clearance has freed up large areas of grazing land, and has unblocked access to safe firewood collection and collection of water. Corn, lentils and wheat are common crops that grow in the areas that have been cleared. Saffron is also grown. When asked about the income from these crops, the women said that this depends on the weather conditions, and how good the season was. It is common that men take the surplus crops to the market in Heart to be sold. One key impact of clearance is that women are no longer worried about their children having accidents. Before, the women used to worry a lot about their children.

Problems in the village
Qroug area of the community is a good source for firewood collection. The women would like this place to be surveyed and cleared, so they can have safe access to firewood collection. Women still use this area, but don’t feel safe there when they collect firewood. The women didn’t have very much information about landmine relates issues in the village, due to their limited movements outside the home.
**ANNEX 4**

**Summary of economic impacts of mine action**

**Summary of economic data from the 4 villages**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>By sex of respondents</th>
<th>Shikaban</th>
<th>Qalat-i-Ghazi</th>
<th>Jibraeel</th>
<th>Qala-e-Shater</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land price before clearance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Afs20,000/jirib</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land price after clearance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Afs100,000/jirib</td>
<td>Afs300-350,000/jirib</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Afs2,400,00/jirib</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of houses built</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>30 in local village; 600 in wider area affected by hazards</td>
<td>450 in village; 10,000 in wider area</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value per house</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Afs 200-350,000</td>
<td>Afs 500,000-1million</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Afs 3-4million</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Afs 3.5-4million</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other infrastructure in hazard-affected area</strong></td>
<td>From both</td>
<td>Clinic, schools, mosque, electricity, CDC office, shops built at cost of Afs500 each</td>
<td>Brick factory</td>
<td>Shops, embroidery factory (not functioning yet), schools, mosque, electricity supply (cost USD100k), water supply, telephone, roads, bridge, play areas.</td>
<td>Shops (cost Afs200 each), electricity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Crop yields</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>Wheat: 630kg/jirib</td>
<td>Wheat: 630-11120 kg/jirib</td>
<td>Wheat: 1260kg/jirib</td>
<td>Wheat: 560-2240kg/jirib (weather dependent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunflower: 350kg/jirib</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sunflower: 630-11120 kg/jirib</td>
<td>Sunflower: 1260kg/jirib</td>
<td>Wheat: 560-2240kg/jirib (weather dependent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maize: 1120kg/jirib</td>
<td></td>
<td>Maize: 1120kg/jirib</td>
<td>Maize: 1260kg/jirib</td>
<td>Wheat: 560-2240kg/jirib (weather dependent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Wheat: 140-1400kg/jirib</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Wheat: 1680kg/jirib</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Crop sale price in market</strong></td>
<td><strong>Men</strong></td>
<td>Income from wheat per farm = Afs 160,000 per year</td>
<td>Wheat: Afs 17/kg Sunflower: Afs 43 /kg Maize: Afs 17/kg NB: Production cost of wheat is USD 195/jirib</td>
<td>Income from wheat per farm = Afs 160,000 per year</td>
<td>Wheat: Afs 22/Kg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Numbers and grazing of livestock</strong></th>
<th><strong>Men</strong></th>
<th>500 animals total (cows, sheep and donkeys)</th>
<th>Livestock graze arable land in spring and after harvest. Every household has 1-2 livestock</th>
<th>Livestock graze cropped land-</th>
<th>-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Livestock graze arable land for 3 months of the year</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Income from livestock (per cow)</strong></th>
<th><strong>Men</strong></th>
<th>USD 200-300/year</th>
<th>USD 200-250/year</th>
<th>-</th>
<th>Afs 50,000/year (meat and milk)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Afs 50,000/year (meat and milk)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>